SAUNDERS, B., DE OLIVEIRA, L.F., DOLAN, E., DURKALEC-MICHALSKI, K., MCNAUGHTON, L., ARTIOLI, G.G. and SWINTON, P.A. 2022. Sodium bicarbonate supplementation and the female athlete: a brief commentary with small scale systematic review and meta-analysis. *European journal of sport science* [online], 22(5): nutrition for female athletes, pages 745-754. Available from: <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/17461391.2021.1880649</u>

Sodium bicarbonate supplementation and the female athlete: a brief commentary with small scale systematic review and meta-analysis.

SAUNDERS, B., FARIAS DE OLIVEIRA, L., DOLAN, E., DURKALEC-MICHALSKI, K., MCNAUGHTON, L., ARTIOLI, G.G. and SWINTON, P.A.

2022

This is an Accepted Manuscript version of the following article, accepted for publication in European Journal of Sport Science. SAUNDERS, B., DE OLIVEIRA, L.F., DOLAN, E., DURKALEC-MICHALSKI, K., MCNAUGHTON, L., ARTIOLI, G.G. and SWINTON, P.A. 2022. Sodium bicarbonate supplementation and the female athlete: a brief commentary with small scale systematic review and meta-analysis. European journal of sport science [online], 22(5): nutrition for female athletes, pages 745-754. Available from:

https://doi.org/10.1080/17461391.2021.1880649. It is deposited under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License (<u>http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/</u>) which permits non-commercial re-use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.



This document was downloaded from https://openair.rgu.ac.uk



1	Sodium bicarbonate supplementation and the female athlete: A brief commentary with				
2	small scale systematic review and meta-analysis				
3	Running head: Sodium bicarbonate and the female athlete				
4					
5	Bryan Saunders ^{1,2} , Luana Farias de Oliveira ¹ , Eimear Dolan ¹ , Krzysztof Durkalec-				
6	Michalski ^{3,4} , Lars McNaughton ⁵ , Guilherme Giannini Artioli ¹ , Paul Alan Swinton ⁶				
7					
8	¹ Applied Physiology and Nutrition Research Group, School of Physical Education and Sport;				
9	Rheumatology Division; Faculdade de Medicina FMUSP, Universidade de Sao Paulo, Sao				
10	Paulo, SP, BR, University of São Paulo, SP, BR.				
11	² Institute of Orthopaedics and Traumatology, Faculty of Medicine FMUSP, University of São				
12	Paulo, Brazil.				
13	³ Department of Dietetics, Poznań University of Physical Education, Poznań, Poland.				
14	⁴ Department of Human Nutrition and Dietetics, Poznań University of Life Sciences, Poznań,				
15	Poland.				
16	⁵ Sports Nutrition and Performance Group, Department of Sport and Physical Activity, Edge				
17	Hill University, Ormskirk, United Kingdom.				
18	⁶ School of Health Sciences, Robert Gordon University, United Kingdom.				
19					
20	Correspondence:				
21	Dr Bryan Saunders				
22	Applied Physiology & Nutrition Research Group,				
23	Rheumatology Division, Faculty of Medicine FMUSP,				
24	Av. Dr. Arnaldo, 455 - Cerqueira César - CEP: 01246903				
25	University of São Paulo,				
26	São Paulo, SP, Brazil.				
27	E-mail: drbryansaunders@outlook.com				
28	Phone: +55 11 3061-8789				

29 Fax: +55 11 3813-5921

30 ABSTRACT

Sodium bicarbonate (SB) is considered an effective ergogenic supplement for improving high-31 intensity exercise capacity and performance, although recent data suggests that women may be 32 less amenable to its ergogenic effects than men. Currently, an apparent paucity of data on 33 women means no consensus exists on whether women benefit from SB supplementation. The 34 aim of the current study was to quantify the proportion of the published literature on SB 35 36 supplementation that includes women, and to synthesise the evidence regarding its effects on blood bicarbonate and exercise performance in women by performing a systematic review and 37 38 meta-analysis. Electronic searches of the literature were undertaken using three databases (MEDLINE, Embase, SPORTDiscus) to identify relevant articles. All meta-analyses were 39 performed within a Bayesian framework. A total of 149 SB articles were identified, 11 of which 40 41 contained individual group data for women. Results indicated a pooled blood bicarbonate increase of 7.4 [95%CrI: 4.2 to 10.4 mmol·L⁻¹] following supplementation and a pooled 42 standardised exercise effect size of 0.37 [95%CrI: -0.06 to 0.92]. The SB literature is skewed, 43 with only 20% (30 studies) of studies employing female participants, of which only 11 studies 44 (7.4%) provided group analyses exclusively in women. Despite the small amount of available 45 data, results are consistent in showing that SB supplementation in women leads to large 46 changes in blood bicarbonate and that there is strong evidence for a positive ergogenic effect 47 on exercise performance that is likely to be small to medium in magnitude. 48

Keywords: Ergogenic aid, anaerobic capacity, acidosis, glycolysis, sex differences, highintensity exercise.

52 Introduction

Sodium bicarbonate is considered an effective ergogenic supplement (Maughan et al., 2018), 53 with repeated meta-analytical data supporting its use for improving high-intensity exercise 54 capacity and performance (Carr, Hopkins, & Gore, 2011; Christensen, Shirai, Ritz, & 55 Nordsborg, 2017; Matson & Tran, 1993; Peart, Siegler, & Vince, 2012). This is due to an 56 increase in blood pH and circulating bicarbonate concentration (i.e., alkalosis) following 57 58 ingestion, augmenting the buffering potential of the body. This increased buffering capacity can improve control of exercise-induced metabolic acidosis, characterized by hydrogen ion 59 60 (H⁺) accumulation that is detrimental to exercise performance due to its interference with several metabolic and contractile processes (Allen, Lamb, & Westerblad, 2008; Fitts, 1994; 61 Jarvis, Woodward, Debold, & Walcott, 2018; Sundberg, Hunter, Trappe, Smith, & Fitts, 2018). 62

63

A number of factors may moderate the effect of SB supplementation on exercise outcomes, 64 including supplement dose, timing and training status (Heibel, Perim, Oliveira, McNaughton, 65 & Saunders, 2018). However, little is currently known about whether sex influences the 66 response to SB supplementation, although this seems plausible given evidence that women 67 have a lower tolerance for high-intensity exercise performance than men (Russ, Lanza, 68 Rothman, & Kent-Braun, 2005) likely due in part to less overall muscle mass (Hegge et al., 69 2016; Janssen, Heymsfield, Wang, & Ross, 2000) and lower type II muscle fibre distribution 70 71 (Porter, Stuart, Boij, & Lexell, 2002; Simoneau & Bouchard, 1989). Findings demonstrate women also have a lower overall capacity for glycolysis due to lower glycolytic enzyme 72 activity (Green, Fraser, & Ranney, 1984), leading to less acidosis (Russ, Lanza, Rothman, & 73 Kent-Braun, 2005). Theoretically, this could mean that women may have a smaller response to 74 a buffering agent intended to improve high-intensity exercise performance. A recent study 75 supports this theory showing an improvement in Wingate and wrestling specific performance 76

77 following SB supplementation in men, but not women (Durkalec-Michalski, Zawieja, Zawieja, Michalowska, & Podgorski, 2020). These results imply a potential sex dysmorphism that the 78 authors attributed to the aforementioned differences in anaerobic capacities. Carr et al. (2011) 79 previously showed unclear evidence of a modifying of sex for SB while conflicting evidence 80 regarding the efficacy of SB to improve exercise outcomes in women exists, with both positive 81 (Delextrat et al., 2018; McNaughton, Ford, & Newbold, 1997) and null (Macutkiewicz & 82 Sunderland, 2018; Voskamp, van den Bos, Foster, de Koning, & Noordhof, 2020) results 83 reported. These inconsistent findings appear to contrast with the strong evidence of a positive 84 85 effect previously reported in studies with predominantly male participants (Carr et al., 2011; Christensen et al., 2017; Matson & Tran, 1993; Peart et al., 2012). Disparity in the quantity of 86 data available for women compared to men might contribute to the current uncertainty and it 87 is important to quantify and summarise current evidence for SB in women. Therefore, the aim 88 of the current study was to quantify the proportion of the published literature on SB 89 supplementation that includes women and to synthesise the evidence regarding its ergogenic 90 effect on women, using a systematic review and meta-analytic approach. 91

92 Methods

93 *Study Eligibility*

The protocol for this study was designed in accordance with Preferred Reporting Items for 94 Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines (Moher, Liberati, Tetzlaff, 95 Altman, & Group, 2009) and the research question determined with reference to PICOS 96 (Population, Intervention, Comparator, Outcomes and Study Design). The study was not pre-97 98 registered. Initially, the literature was screened to identify all SB supplementation studies with both male and female *populations*. This broader screening strategy was used to identify the 99 100 proportion of the total evidence base that employed female participants. The data extraction and meta-analysis was subsequently based only on those studies that included a group 101 consisting of women only. The *intervention* must have employed an acute (<1 day) or chronic 102 103 (>1 day) supplementation protocol with SB prior to performing an exercise test. The comparator for the meta-analysis determined that only single or double-blinded, placebo-104 controlled studies were included. Studies that reported on outcomes based on exercise 105 performance and capacity tests were considered for inclusion (Saunders et al., 2017) and study 106 design allowed both crossover and parallel group designs. Only peer-reviewed, English 107 language, original human studies were included. 108

109

110 Search Strategy

An electronic search of the literature was undertaken using three databases (MEDLINE, Embase, SPORTDiscus) to identify relevant articles. The search was originally conducted to inform a systematic review and meta-analysis on the use of extracellular buffers on exercise outcomes. The search terms "sodium bicarbonate", "sodium citrate", "calcium lactate", "sodium lactate" and "alkalosis" were individually concatenated with "supplementation", "exercise", "training", "athlete" and "performance". Following duplicate removal, a 2-phase search strategy (title/abstract; full text) was employed by two independent reviewers (LFO and

118 ED) using freely available software – Rayyan QCRI (Ouzzani, Hammady, Fedorowicz, &

119 <u>Elmagarmid, 2016</u>). A final search was completed in February 2020.

120

121 *Certainty in cumulative outcomes*

Certainty in blood and exercise outcomes was determined according to the framework provided 122 123 by the Grading of Recommendations, Assessment, Development and Evaluations (GRADE) working group (Guyatt et al., 2008). This approach considers eight factors to determine the 124 125 level of certainty in outcomes, five of which can be used to downgrade certainty in outcomes (risk of bias, imprecision, inconsistency, indirectness and publication bias), while potential 126 upgrading factors can include large effects; evidence of dose-response or the presence of 127 plausible residual confounding factors. All studies in the current review were initially defined 128 as "high" because they were all randomized, blinded, placebo-controlled trials. This *a-priori* 129 rating was either maintained, or downgraded following application of the strategy, allowing 130 certainty in outcomes to be graded as "high", "moderate", "low" or "very low". Risk of bias 131 was assessed using the most recent Cochrane tool for assessing risk of bias in randomized trials 132 (RoB 2) (Sterne et al., 2019). Evaluation of risk of bias was performed in a blinded fashion by 133 a single reviewer (LFO) and verified by a second reviewer (BS). 134

135

136 *Data Extraction*

Data extraction was completed by a single reviewer (LFO) using a standardised and pre-piloted data extraction form with Microsoft Excel, and the extraction was verified by a second reviewer (BS). The following information was extracted: (i) author and publication year, (ii) study design; (iii) sample population; (iv) intervention protocol; (v) exercise protocol (vi) blood and exercise outcome data. Where numerical data were not directly available, blood (Bishop & <u>Claudius, 2005; Bishop, Edge, Davis, & Goodman, 2004; Kozak-Collins, Burke, & Schoene,</u>
<u>1994; Tan et al., 2010</u>) data were extracted from figures using digitizing software (Digitizelt;
(<u>Rakap, Rakap, Evran, & Cig, 2016</u>). To avoid duplication bias, when an exercise protocol
resulted in multiples outcome measures of the same exercise test, a solitary outcome measure
was extracted based upon the following hierarchy: i) total work done; ii) mean output
throughout the test (*i.e.*, mean power output; mean velocity; mean height); time-to-completion
(performance test)/time to exhaustion (capacity test).

149

150 Statistical Analysis

All meta-analyses (performed by PAS) were conducted within a Bayesian framework to 151 provide a more flexible modelling approach and enable results to be interpreted intuitively 152 through reporting of subjective probabilities (Kruschke & Liddell, 2018). The first meta-153 analysis pooled group pre- and post-supplement blood bicarbonate data, with placebo-154 controlled mean change effect sizes used to summarise findings reported in the actual units of 155 measurement. The second meta-analysis pooled group exercise performance data, with effect 156 sizes calculated by standardising the mean difference in the supplementation and placebo 157 conditions by the placebo standard deviation. Sampling variances of effect sizes required an 158 estimate of the correlation between paired data that are generally not provided in studies. To 159 account for this, an initial estimate was made assuming a correlation of 0.7 and an informative 160 161 Gaussian prior approximating a correlation between 0.5 and 1 were included. A correction for small sample sizes was applied for both the effect size and its within study variance (Morris & 162 <u>DeShon, 2002</u>). To investigate the potential for a moderating effect of exercise duration, binary 163 exercise test categories were created ($<30 \text{ s}, \geq 30 \text{ s}$; (Saunders et al., 2017)). Three-level meta-164 analytic models were used to account for the inclusion of multiple outcomes within a single 165 study (Van den Noortgate, Lopez-Lopez, Marin-Martinez, & Sanchez-Meca, 2013). 166

167 Inferences were performed on posterior samples generated using the Hamiltonian Markov Chain Monte Carlo method, reporting median values and 95% credible intervals (CrIs). 168 Heterogeneity in the data was quantified by the between study variance parameter which in 169 Bayesian meta-analysis includes uncertainty described by the CrI. Additionally, probabilities 170 were calculated for pooled effect sizes exceeding the threshold of 5 mmol·L⁻¹ [P(Increase > 5)] 171 for blood bicarbonate (Jones et al., 2016); and exceeding effect sizes (ES) of 0, 0.2 and 0.5 172 (zero, small and medium) [P(Increase > ES)] for exercise outcomes. Probabilities were 173 calculated using the posterior samples of the parameters and the proportion of values exceeding 174 175 the specified threshold. Due to the small number of data points and potential for small-study effects, sensitivity analyses were completed using robust meta-analyses with random effect 176 fitted with a t-distribution. Funnel plots were not explored due to limited data and consistency 177 178 across study sample sizes. Analyses were performed using the R wrapper package brms interfaced with Stan to perform sampling (Bürkner, 2017). 179

180 **Results**

181 *Study search*

A total of 149 SB articles were identified following the search and filter (Figure 1), of which 182 113 (76%) recruited men only and 9 (6%) women only. A total of 21 studies (14%) recruited 183 both men and women, 2 of which separated according to sex for analyses, and 19 of which did 184 not, grouping data for both men and women. Six (4%) studies did not specify the sex of their 185 participants. This resulted in a total of 1175 men and 134 women analysed separately. Studies 186 that analysed men and women together comprised 273 individuals, of which 195 were men and 187 188 78 were women. Of the 30 studies including women, only one reported information relating to the menstrual cycle or contraceptive use of the participants (Macutkiewicz & Sunderland, 189 2018), with the same study the only to control for menstrual cycle phase during the testing 190 191 period. Only 11 studies with standalone female groups were taken forward to the meta-analysis.



192

Figure 1. Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines flow
 chart for literature search and study selection.

196 Meta-analysis

Data from ten studies that contained separate data for women were included in the metaanalysis (Table 1). One parallel group study was not included in the analysis since it involved
chronic SB or placebo supplementation in female students prior to interval training performed
three times per week for eight weeks, but did not involve supplementation prior to the exercise
outcome test (Edge, Bishop, & Goodman, 2006). *Blood bicarbonate*

Blood bicarbonate data were available from four studies (Bishop & Claudius, 2005; Bishop,

- 205 Edge, & Goodman, 2004; McNaughton et al., 1997; Tan et al., 2010) totalling 39 participants.
- Results indicated a pooled blood bicarbonate increase of 7.4 [95%CrI: 4.2 to 10.4 mmol· L^{-1} ;
- 207 P(Increase > 5) = 0.937] following supplementation. The between study variance was 3.7

208 [95%CrI: 2.2 to 7.8 mmol· L^{-1}]. Median values and probabilities remained unchanged in the 209 sensitivity analysis conducted with all data points and robust variance estimation.

210

211 Exercise data

Twelve exercise outcomes were obtained from ten studies (Bishop & Claudius, 2005; Bishop, 212 Edge, Davis, et al., 2004; Delextrat et al., 2018; Durkalec-Michalski et al., 2020; Macutkiewicz 213 214 & Sunderland, 2018; McNaughton et al., 1997; Tan et al., 2010; Tiryaki & Atterborn, 1995; Voskamp et al., 2020) totalling 109 participants. Results indicated a pooled standardised effect 215 size of 0.37 [95%CrI: -0.06 to 0.92; P(Increase > 0) = 0.962; P(Increase > 0.2) = 0.784;216 P(Increase > 0.5) = 0.263; Figure 2] and a between study variance of 0.38 [95%CrI: 0.02 to 217 1.2]. Sensitivity analysis with the robust t-distribution to account for the small number of data 218 points and existence of some large individual effects sizes estimated a slightly smaller pooled 219 effect size 0.29 [95%CrI: -0.07 to 0.84; P(Increase > 0) = 0.949; P(Increase > 0.2) = 0.689;220 P(Increase > 0.5) = 0.191]. Meta-regression provided no substantive evidence of a moderating 221 effect of exercise duration, with the estimated difference between short (<30 s; 5 studies, n=54) 222 and longer duration (≥30 s; 6 studies, n=71) exercise tests estimated to be 0.02 [95%CrI: -0.52 223 to 0.55; P(Difference > 0) = 0.526]. 224

225



Figure 2. Bayesian Forest Plot of effect sizes for sodium bicarbonate (SB) supplementation on exercise performance. Distributions represent "shrunken estimates" based on all effects size obtained from the study, the random effects model fitted and borrowed information across studies to reduce uncertainty. Black circles and connected intervals represent the median value and 95% credible intervals for the shrunken estimates. White circles and intervals represent the raw estimates and sampling variance calculated directly from study data.

233

234 *Certainty in cumulative outcomes*

Blood and exercise outcomes were assigned an *a-priori* certainty rating of "high" because they 235 were all based on data from blinded, randomized, placebo-controlled trials (as defined by the 236 eligibility criteria). All studies included in the meta-analysis were classified as having "some 237 concerns" according to ROB2 (Figure 3). Three studies had some concerns in Domain 4 238 (Measurement of the outcome) due to a lack of familiarisation to the protocol (Kozak-Collins 239 et al., 1994; McNaughton et al., 1997) or a non-double-blind study design (Macutkiewicz & 240 Sunderland, 2018). All studies were classified as having some concerns due to a lack of a pre-241 specified analysis plan (as outlined in Domain 5). This was not deemed to pose an undue risk 242 to either outcome measure, thus no outcome was downgraded based on risk of bias 243

244 (Supplementary Table 1).

		Risk of bias domains					
		D1	D2	D3	D4	D5	Overall
Study	Bishop et al. (2004)	+	+	+	+	-	-
	Bishop & Claudius (2005)	+	+	+	+	-	-
	Delextrat et al. (2018)	+	+	+	+	-	-
	Durkalec-Michalski et al. (2020)	+	+	+	+	-	-
	Kozak-Collins et al. (1994)	+	+	+	-	-	-
	Macutkiewicz & Sunderland (2018)	+	+	+	-	-	-
	McNaughton et al. (1997)	+	+	+	-	-	-
	Tan et al. (2010)	+	+	+	+	-	-
	Tiryaki & Atterbom (1995)	+	+	+	+	-	-
	Voskamp et al. (2020)	+	+	+	+	-	-
		Domains: Judgemen				nent	
	D1: Blas arising from the randomization process. D2: Blas due to deviations from intended intervention.						ome concerns
		D3: Bias due to missing outcome data.					w

D4: Bias in measurement of the outcome.

Figure 3. Risk of bias assessment of the ten studies included in the meta-analysis. (Plot was created using *robvis* (<u>McGuinness & Higgins, 2020</u>) and are in a colourblind-friendly colour scheme).

249

Both blood and exercise outcomes were downgraded for imprecision due to low numbers of 250 outcome measures (four for blood, 12 for exercise). Consistent blood and exercise effects 251 meant no measure was downgraded for inconsistency. Almost all studies were performed in 252 young, trained women with commonly employed dosing strategies and, thus, deemed to have 253 direct, real-life applicability for the female athlete and were not downgraded for indirectness. 254 Nonetheless, downgrading of certainty based on indirectness may be advisable for those 255 interested in other populations (e.g., middle-aged, or elderly populations) or exercise outcomes 256 (e.g., resistance/strength exercise). Publication bias was not explored due to limited data and 257 consistency across study sample sizes, meaning no outcome was downgraded for this domain 258 but future meta-analyses with a larger number of studies will allow this to be ascertained. Blood 259 outcomes were upgraded according to GRADE recommendations because they were consistent 260

D5: Bias in selection of the reported result.

with previous meta-analytic results based on the blood bicarbonate response to SB supplementation (<u>Carr et al., 2011</u>) and align with evidence-based and plausible physiological mechanisms. Certainty in exercise outcomes were not upgraded. Thus, certainty in blood outcomes was considered high, and certainty in exercise outcomes considered moderate (Supplementary Table 1).

266 Discussion

The SB literature is skewed regarding investigations in women, with only 20% (30 studies) of 267 studies employing female participants, of which only 11 studies (7.4%) provided group 268 analyses exclusively in women. Despite the small amount of available data, results are 269 consistent in showing that SB supplementation in women leads to large changes in blood 270 bicarbonate and that there is strong evidence for a positive ergogenic effect on exercise 271 272 performance [P(Increase > 0) = 0.962]. Due to the small amount of data available and the substantive heterogeneity, it was not possible to obtain a precise estimate of the pooled effect 273 274 size for exercise performance. However, the analyses suggest the effect is most likely to be between small and moderate. 275

276

Research on exercise physiology and nutritional supplements in women is notoriously scarce 277 278 (Burke, 2017; O'Halloran, 2020), and the SB literature is no different with only 11 of 149 studies including a standalone female group. Across the whole research base comprising men 279 and women, strong evidence exists to support the use of SB to improve exercise outcomes as 280 demonstrated by multiple meta-analyses (Carr et al., 2011; Christensen et al., 2017; Matson & 281 Tran, 1993; Peart et al., 2012). The current meta-analytical data restricted to female participants 282 and based on nine crossover studies and one parallel group design comprising 118 participants 283 is consistent with previous evidence. Whilst uncertainty in the pooled effect size was high due 284 285 to the limited number of data points and substantive heterogeneity across studies, the probability that the pooled effect size was small or above was estimated to be around 78%, and 286 the median standardised estimate of 0.37 is consistent with previous research conducted with 287 predominantly male participants (0.36 - 0.44) (Christensen et al., 2017; Matson & Tran, 1993; 288 Peart et al., 2012). 289

The recent data of Durkalec-Michalski et al. (2020) showed that SB supplementation improved 291 wrestling specific performance in men, but not women. The authors speculated that 292 physiological factors that might explain these divergent responses include differences in 293 muscle fibre type and anaerobic capacity. Women typically have less overall muscle mass 294 (Hegge et al., 2016; Janssen et al., 2000), type II muscle fibres (Porter et al., 2002; Simoneau 295 & Bouchard, 1989) and lower glycolytic capacity (Green et al., 1984; Russ et al., 2005; 296 297 Tarnopolsky, 2000), meaning they might be less susceptible to performance affecting decreases in muscle pH and, thus, also less susceptible to performance improvements with increased 298 299 buffering capacity. The results of this study contrast with this hypothesis and the results of Durkalec-Michalski et al. (2020) and suggest that women do benefit from SB supplementation. 300 This discrepancy might be due to a low sample size in Durkalec-Michalski et al. (2020) which 301 302 was potentially unable to detect small differences in performance of these exercise tests. The 303 number of women in their study was almost half that of men (18 vs. 33), and although women showed no improvements while men did, performance changes for women appear similar to 304 those of men (Figure 3 of the original article). 305

306

Some evidence indicates that menstrual cycle phase may impact anaerobic exercise capacity, 307 with reduced performance previously observed in the early follicular phase of the menstrual 308 cycle (Masterson, 1999), although other studies failed to replicate this finding (Bushman, 309 310 Masterson, & Nelsen, 2006; Sunderland & Nevill, 2003; Sunderland, Tunaley, Horner, Harmer, & Stokes, 2011). Greater evidence for no effect of menstrual cycle is consistent with 311 recent meta-analytic data that indicated that exercise test performance may be only trivially 312 reduced during the early follicular phase of the menstrual cycle (McNulty et al., 2020), 313 although it is important to highlight that the observed effect was very small, and varied widely 314 across studies. Nonetheless, these data indicating a potential difference in exercise performance 315

across the menstrual cycle could also be taken to imply that the efficacy of ergogenic aids 316 intended to enhance exercise test performance may also be impacted by menstrual cycle phase, 317 particularly at the individual level. Despite this, only one of the 11 studies included within this 318 review reported information relative to menstrual cycle/contraceptive use and to 319 standardisation of tests (or not) according to menstrual cycle phase. Macutkiewicz and 320 Sunderland (2018) reported that seven of their eight participants had normal menstrual cycles 321 322 while one had been taking an oral contraceptive for over a year. The two experimental trials in this study were conducted during days 4-14 of the follicular phase or during days 5-20 of 323 324 resuming the oral contraceptive pill. This was verified by measuring plasma progesterone concentrations, which were not different between trials, although it is important to highlight 325 that progesterone levels remain relatively stable during the follicular phase of the menstrual 326 cycle, whereas oestrogen increases rapidly meaning that different oestrogen concentrations 327 between trials cannot be ruled out. Currently, no information exists as to whether menstrual 328 cycle phase would alter the physiological and exercise responses to SB supplementation. 329 However, considering the effects of ergogenic supplements are generally small, even very 330 small changes in exercise capacity during different phases of the menstrual cycle (McNulty et 331 al., 2020) may potentially modify these effects and this warrants investigation. 332

333

Most studies included here provided an acute $0.3 - 0.4 \text{ g} \cdot \text{kg}^{-1}\text{BM}$ dose of SB in the 180 – 90 min prior to exercise, although two provided SB chronically (<u>Delextrat et al., 2018; Durkalec-</u><u>Michalski et al., 2020</u>). These acute supplementation protocols are most commonly applied in the literature and also appear to be the most effective (<u>Heibel et al., 2018</u>). Overall, the effect on exercise is likely to be between small to medium in magnitude, which is consistent with what we currently know about the influence of SB in men. Based on these findings, we do not believe there is any evidence to support sex-specific SB dosing recommendations and that current recommendations of $0.2 - 0.3 \text{ g} \cdot \text{kg}^{-1}\text{BM}$ of SB taken 60 - 180 min prior to highintensity exercise (<u>de Oliveira, Saunders, Yamaguchi, Swinton, & Artioli, 2020</u>) appear appropriate for the female athlete.

344

This meta-analysis is somewhat limited by the low number of included articles and exercise 345 outcomes, with only four studies reporting pre- to post-supplementation blood bicarbonate 346 347 changes and twelve exercise outcomes. Nonetheless, evidence for large changes in blood bicarbonate was very strong and certainty in this outcome was high. Although certainty in 348 349 exercise outcomes was only moderate, there was strong evidence that effects on exercise outcomes was greater than zero. This is further supported by individual study data, all of which 350 suggests very small to large positive effects (Figure 2). Sodium bicarbonate supplementation 351 has been shown to improve muscular endurance, but not muscular strength (Grgic et al., 2020). 352 However, none of the included studies here measured muscular strength or endurance and, 353 thus, any conclusions must be limited to these predominantly aerobic and anaerobic exercise 354 protocols. Finally, these data are highly applicable for trained young women since most studies 355 employed trained or elite female athletes with an average age across these studies of 19 - 26356 years. The generalisability of these conclusions to middle-aged or elderly populations is 357 currently less certain. 358

359

In conclusion, the scientific literature regarding the efficacy of SB on exercise performance is highly biased towards male participants. The limited data in women does provide evidence of a small to medium positive effect of supplementation on exercise performance.

363 **References**

- Allen, D. G., Lamb, G. D., & Westerblad, H. (2008). Skeletal muscle fatigue: cellular
 mechanisms. *Physiol Rev*, 88(1), 287-332. doi: 10.1152/physrev.00015.2007
- Bishop, D., & Claudius, B. (2005). Effects of induced metabolic alkalosis on prolonged
 intermittent-sprint performance. *Med Sci Sports Exerc*, 37(5), 759-767
- Bishop, D., Edge, J., Davis, C., & Goodman, C. (2004). Induced metabolic alkalosis affects
 muscle metabolism and repeated-sprint ability. *Med Sci Sports Exerc*, 36(5), 807-813
- Bishop, D., Edge, J., & Goodman, C. (2004). Muscle buffer capacity and aerobic fitness are
 associated with repeated-sprint ability in women. *Eur J Appl Physiol*, *92*(4-5), 540-547.
 doi: 10.1007/s00421-004-1150-1
- Burke, L. M. (2017). Practical Issues in Evidence-Based Use of Performance Supplements:
 Supplement Interactions, Repeated Use and Individual Responses. *Sports Med*,
 47(Suppl 1), 79-100. doi: 10.1007/s40279-017-0687-1
- Bürkner, P.-C. (2017). brms: An R Package for Bayesian Multilevel Models Using Stan.
 Journal of Statistical Software, 80(1), 28. doi: 10.18637/jss.v080.i01
- Bushman, B., Masterson, G., & Nelsen, J. (2006). Anaerobic power performance and the
 menstrual cycle: eumenorrheic and oral contraceptive users. *J Sports Med Phys Fitness*,
 46(1), 132-137
- Carr, A. J., Hopkins, W. G., & Gore, C. J. (2011). Effects of acute alkalosis and acidosis on
 performance: a meta-analysis. *Sports Med*, 41(10), 801-814. doi: 10.2165/11591440 000000000-00000
- Christensen, P. M., Shirai, Y., Ritz, C., & Nordsborg, N. B. (2017). Caffeine and Bicarbonate
 for Speed. A Meta-Analysis of Legal Supplements Potential for Improving Intense
 Endurance Exercise Performance. *Front Physiol*, *8*, 240. doi:
 10.3389/fphys.2017.00240
- de Oliveira, L. F., Saunders, B., Yamaguchi, G., Swinton, P., & Artioli, G. G. (2020). Is 388 Individualization of Sodium Bicarbonate Ingestion Based on Time to Peak Necessary? 389 Medicine Å Science in Sports k Exercise, *52*(8), 1801-1808. doi: 390 10.1249/MSS.00000000002313 391
- Delextrat, A., Mackessy, S., Arceo-Rendon, L., Scanlan, A., Ramsbottom, R., & CallejaGonzalez, J. (2018). Effects of Three-Day Serial Sodium Bicarbonate Loading on
 Performance and Physiological Parameters During a Simulated Basketball Test in
 Female University Players. *Int J Sport Nutr Exerc Metab*, 28(5), 547-552. doi:
 10.1123/ijsnem.2017-0353
- 397 Durkalec-Michalski, K., Zawieja, E. E., Zawieja, B. E., Michalowska, P., & Podgorski, T.
 398 (2020). The gender dependent influence of sodium bicarbonate supplementation on
 399 anaerobic power and specific performance in female and male wrestlers. *Sci Rep, 10*(1),
 400 1878. doi: 10.1038/s41598-020-57590-x
- 401 Edge, J., Bishop, D., & Goodman, C. (2006). Effects of chronic NaHCO3 ingestion during
 402 interval training on changes to muscle buffer capacity, metabolism, and short-term
 403 endurance performance. J Appl Physiol (1985), 101(3), 918-925. doi:
 404 10.1152/japplphysiol.01534.2005
- 405 Fitts, R. H. (1994). Cellular mechanisms of muscle fatigue. *Physiol Rev*, 74(1), 49-94
- Green, H. J., Fraser, I. G., & Ranney, D. A. (1984). Male and female differences in enzyme
 activities of energy metabolism in vastus lateralis muscle. *J Neurol Sci*, 65(3), 323-331.
 doi: 10.1016/0022-510x(84)90095-9
- Grgic, J., Rodriguez, R. F., Garofolini, A., Saunders, B., Bishop, D. J., Schoenfeld, B. J., &
 Pedisic, Z. (2020). Effects of Sodium Bicarbonate Supplementation on Muscular

- 411 Strength and Endurance: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis. *Sports Med*, 50(7),
 412 1361-1375. doi: 10.1007/s40279-020-01275-y
- Guyatt, G. H., Oxman, A. D., Vist, G. E., Kunz, R., Falck-Ytter, Y., Alonso-Coello, P., ...
 Group, G. W. (2008). GRADE: an emerging consensus on rating quality of evidence
 and strength of recommendations. *BMJ*, 336(7650), 924-926. doi:
 10.1136/bmj.39489.470347.AD
- Hegge, A. M., Bucher, E., Ettema, G., Faude, O., Holmberg, H. C., & Sandbakk, O. (2016).
 Gender differences in power production, energetic capacity and efficiency of elite
 crosscountry skiers during wholebody, upperbody, and arm poling. *Eur J Appl Physiol*, *116*(2), 291-300. doi: 10.1007/s00421-015-3281-y
- Heibel, A. B., Perim, P. H. L., Oliveira, L. F., McNaughton, L. R., & Saunders, B. (2018).
 Time to Optimize Supplementation: Modifying Factors Influencing the Individual
 Responses to Extracellular Buffering Agents. *Front Nutr, 5*, 35. doi: 10.3389/fnut.2018.00035
- Janssen, I., Heymsfield, S. B., Wang, Z. M., & Ross, R. (2000). Skeletal muscle mass and
 distribution in 468 men and women aged 18-88 yr. *J Appl Physiol (1985), 89*(1), 8188. doi: 10.1152/jappl.2000.89.1.81
- Jarvis, K., Woodward, M., Debold, E. P., & Walcott, S. (2018). Acidosis affects muscle
 contraction by slowing the rates myosin attaches to and detaches from actin. *J Muscle Res Cell Motil.* doi: 10.1007/s10974-018-9499-7
- Jones, R. L., Stellingwerff, T., Artioli, G. G., Saunders, B., Cooper, S., & Sale, C. (2016).
 Dose-Response of Sodium Bicarbonate Ingestion Highlights Individuality in Time
 Course of Blood Analyte Responses. *Int J Sport Nutr Exerc Metab*, 26(5), 445-453.
 doi: 10.1123/ijsnem.2015-0286
- Kozak-Collins, K., Burke, E. R., & Schoene, R. B. (1994). Sodium bicarbonate ingestion does
 not improve performance in women cyclists. *Med Sci Sports Exerc, 26*(12), 1510-1515
- Kruschke, J. K., & Liddell, T. M. (2018). The Bayesian New Statistics: Hypothesis testing,
 estimation, meta-analysis, and power analysis from a Bayesian perspective. *Psychon Bull Rev*, 25(1), 178-206. doi: 10.3758/s13423-016-1221-4
- Macutkiewicz, D., & Sunderland, C. (2018). Sodium bicarbonate supplementation does not
 improve elite women's team sport running or field hockey skill performance. *Physiol Rep*, 6(19), e13818. doi: 10.14814/phy2.13818
- Masterson, G. (1999). The Impact of Menstrual Phases on Anaerobic Power Performance in
 Collegiate Women. *The Journal of Strength & Conditioning Research*, 13(4), 325-329
- Matson, L. G., & Tran, Z. V. (1993). Effects of sodium bicarbonate ingestion on anaerobic
 performance: a meta-analytic review. *Int J Sport Nutr, 3*(1), 2-28
- Maughan, R. J., Burke, L. M., Dvorak, J., Larson-Meyer, D. E., Peeling, P., Phillips, S. M., . .
 Engebretsen, L. (2018). IOC consensus statement: dietary supplements and the highperformance athlete. *Br J Sports Med*, 52(7), 439-455. doi: 10.1136/bjsports-2018099027
- McGuinness, L. A., & Higgins, J. P. T. (2020). Risk-of-bias VISualization (robvis): An R
 package and Shiny web app for visualizing risk-of-bias assessments. *Research Synthesis Methods*, n/a(n/a). doi: 10.1002/jrsm.1411
- McNaughton, L. R., Ford, S., & Newbold, C. (1997). Effect of Sodium Bicarbonate Ingestion
 on High Intensity Exercise in Moderately Trained Women. *The Journal of Strength & Conditioning Research*, 11(2), 98-102
- McNulty, K. L., Elliott-Sale, K. J., Dolan, E., Swinton, P. A., Ansdell, P., Goodall, S., . . .
 Hicks, K. M. (2020). The Effects of Menstrual Cycle Phase on Exercise Performance
 in Eumenorrheic Women: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *Sports Med*,
 50(10), 1813-1827. doi: 10.1007/s40279-020-01319-3

- Moher, D., Liberati, A., Tetzlaff, J., Altman, D. G., & Group, P. (2009). Preferred reporting
 items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. *Ann Intern Med*, 151(4), 264-269, W264
- Morris, S. B., & DeShon, R. P. (2002). Combining effect size estimates in meta-analysis with
 repeated measures and independent-groups designs. *Psychol Methods*, 7(1), 105-125.
 doi: 10.1037/1082-989x.7.1.105
- 467 O'Halloran, K. D. (2020). Mind the gap: widening the demographic to establish new norms in
 468 human physiology. *J Physiol*. doi: 10.1113/JP279986
- 469 Ouzzani, M., Hammady, H., Fedorowicz, Z., & Elmagarmid, A. (2016). Rayyan-a web and
 470 mobile app for systematic reviews. *Systematic Reviews*, 5(1), 210. doi:
 471 10.1186/s13643-016-0384-4
- 472 Peart, D. J., Siegler, J. C., & Vince, R. V. (2012). Practical recommendations for coaches and
 473 athletes: a meta-analysis of sodium bicarbonate use for athletic performance. *J Strength*474 *Cond Res, 26*(7), 1975-1983. doi: 10.1519/JSC.0b013e3182576f3d
- 475 Porter, M. M., Stuart, S., Boij, M., & Lexell, J. (2002). Capillary supply of the tibialis anterior
 476 muscle in young, healthy, and moderately active men and women. *J Appl Physiol*477 (1985), 92(4), 1451-1457. doi: 10.1152/japplphysiol.00744.2001
- 478 Rakap, S., Rakap, S., Evran, D., & Cig, O. (2016). Comparative evaluation of the reliability
 479 and validity of three data extraction programs: UnGraph, GraphClick, and DigitizeIt.
 480 *Computers in Human Behavior*, 55, 159-166. doi:
 481 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2015.09.008
- Russ, D. W., Lanza, I. R., Rothman, D., & Kent-Braun, J. A. (2005). Sex differences in glycolysis during brief, intense isometric contractions. *Muscle Nerve*, 32(5), 647-655.
 doi: 10.1002/mus.20396
- 485 Saunders, B., Elliott-Sale, K., Artioli, G. G., Swinton, P. A., Dolan, E., Roschel, H., . . .
 486 Gualano, B. (2017). β-alanine supplementation to improve exercise capacity and
 487 performance: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Br J Sports Med*, *51*(8), 658-669.
 488 doi: 10.1136/bjsports-2016-096396
- 489 Simoneau, J. A., & Bouchard, C. (1989). Human variation in skeletal muscle fiber-type
 490 proportion and enzyme activities. Am J Physiol, 257(4 Pt 1), E567-572. doi:
 491 10.1152/ajpendo.1989.257.4.E567
- 492 Sterne, J. A. C., Savovic, J., Page, M. J., Elbers, R. G., Blencowe, N. S., Boutron, I., . . .
 493 Higgins, J. P. T. (2019). RoB 2: a revised tool for assessing risk of bias in randomised
 494 trials. *BMJ*, 366, 14898. doi: 10.1136/bmj.14898
- Sundberg, C. W., Hunter, S. K., Trappe, S. W., Smith, C. S., & Fitts, R. H. (2018). Effects of
 elevated H(+) and Pi on the contractile mechanics of skeletal muscle fibres from young
 and old men: implications for muscle fatigue in humans. *J Physiol*, 596(17), 3993-4015.
 doi: 10.1113/JP276018
- Sunderland, C., & Nevill, M. (2003). Effect of the menstrual cycle on performance of
 intermittent, high-intensity shuttle running in a hot environment. *Eur J Appl Physiol*,
 88(4-5), 345-352. doi: 10.1007/s00421-002-0722-1
- Sunderland, C., Tunaley, V., Horner, F., Harmer, D., & Stokes, K. A. (2011). Menstrual cycle
 and oral contraceptives' effects on growth hormone response to sprinting. *Appl Physiol Nutr Metab*, 36(4), 495-502. doi: 10.1139/h11-039
- Tan, F., Polglaze, T., Cox, G., Dawson, B., Mujika, I., & Clark, S. (2010). Effects of induced
 alkalosis on simulated match performance in elite female water polo players. *Int J Sport Nutr Exerc Metab*, 20(3), 198-205. doi: 10.1123/ijsnem.20.3.198
- Tarnopolsky, M. A. (2000). Gender differences in substrate metabolism during endurance
 exercise. *Can J Appl Physiol*, 25(4), 312-327. doi: 10.1139/h00-024

- 510 Tiryaki, G. R., & Atterbom, H. A. (1995). The effects of sodium bicarbonate and sodium citrate 511 on 600 m running time of trained females. *J Sports Med Phys Fitness*, *35*(3), 194-198
- Van den Noortgate, W., Lopez-Lopez, J. A., Marin-Martinez, F., & Sanchez-Meca, J. (2013).
 Three-level meta-analysis of dependent effect sizes. *Behav Res Methods*, 45(2), 576594. doi: 10.3758/s13428-012-0261-6
- Voskamp, A. E., van den Bos, S., Foster, C., de Koning, J. J., & Noordhof, D. A. (2020). The
 Effect of Sodium Bicarbonate Supplementation on the Decline in Gross Efficiency
 During a 2000-m Cycling Time Trial. *Int J Sports Physiol Perform, 15*(5), 741-747.
 doi: 10.1123/ijspp.2019-0177

Authors (Year)	Population	Supplementation	Study Design	Exercise Test	Familiarisation?
Bishop et al. (2004)	Recreational team-sport playing females (N=10)	0.3 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM} 90 min prior to exercise in gelatine capsules. Placebo: NaCl (0.207 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM})	Double-blind, Crossover	5 x 6 s repeated sprint cycling test	Yes
Bishop & Claudius (2005)	Team-sport athletes (N=7)	0.2 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM} 110-90 min and 0.2 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM} 50-20 min prior to exercise in gelatine capsules. Placebo: NaCl (2 x 0.138 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM})	Double-blind, Crossover	Intermittent cycling sprint test 2 x 36 min of 4-s sprints, 100 s active recovery + 20 s recovery passive	Yes
Delextrat et al. (2018)	University basketball players (N=15)	0.4 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM} per day for 3 days in gelatine capsules. Final ingestion the day before the test. Placebo: CaCO ₃ (0.4 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM})	Double-blind, Crossover	Basketball simulation test (repeated sprint and jump performance)	Yes
Edge et al. (2006)	Moderately trained students involved in club level sports (N=16)	 0.2 g·kg⁻¹_{BM} 90 min and 0.2 g·kg⁻¹_{BM} 30 min prior to training throughout 8 weeks of training (3 x/week). Placebo: NaCl (2 x 0.1 mg·kg⁻¹_{BM}) 	Single-blind, Parallel groups	Cycling test at 100% of VO _{2peak} until exhaustion	Yes
Kozak-Collins et al. (1994)	Competitive cyclists (N=7)	0.3 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM} 120 min prior to exercise in gelatine capsules Placebo: NaCl (0.207 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM})	Double-blind, Crossover	1 min cycling at 95% VO _{2max} : 1 min recovery at 60 W (repeated until exhaustion)	No
Macutkiewicz & Sunderland (2018)	Elite hockey players (N=8)	0.2 g⋅kg ⁻¹ _{BM} 180 min and 0.1 g⋅kg ⁻¹ _{BM} 90 min prior to exercise in gelatine capsules. Placebo: Maltodextrin (0.2 g⋅kg ⁻¹ _{BM})	Single-blind, Crossover	Field Hockey Skill Tests Loughborough Intermittent Shuttle Test (4 sets)	Yes
Tan et al. (2010)	Elite water polo players (N=12)	0.3 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM} 90 min prior to exercise in gelatine capsules. Placebo: Corn flour (undefined dose)	Double-blind, Crossover	Water polo match simulation test (59 min protocol with 56 x 10-m maximal-sprint swims)	Yes
McNaughton et al. (1997)	Physically active females (N=10)	0.3 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM} 90 min prior to exercise in solution. Placebo: NaCl (0.207 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM})	Double-blind, Crossover	Single maximal 1-min cycle effort	No
Tiryaki & Atterbom (1995)	Track athletes (N=11) and trained non-athletes (N=4)	0.3 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM} 150 min prior to exercise in solution. Placebo: Sugarless Kool-Aid (undefined dose)	Double-blind, Crossover	600 m running test	Yes
Durkalec-Michalski et al. (2020)	High-level Polish freestyle wrestlers (N=18)	1-2 days: 25 mg $kg^{-1}BM$; 3-5 days: 50 mg kg^{-1}_{BM} ; 6-7 days: 75 mg kg^{-1}_{BM} ; 8- 10 days: 100 mg kg^{-1}_{BM} ; tablets. Placebo: NaCl + maltodextrin (undefined dose)	Double-blind, Parallel groups	2 x Wingate bouts and Dummy Throw Test	Yes
Voskamp et al. (2020)	Competitive cyclists (N=16)	0.3 g·kg ⁻¹ _{BM} 150 min prior to exercise in gelatine capsules	Double-blind, Crossover	2000 m cycling time-trial	Yes

Placebo: sunflower, magnesium,		
amylum (undefined dose)		

BM = body mass