Border urbanism: transdisciplinary perspectives.

ZAMAN, Q.M. and HALL, G.G. (eds.)

2023

This is the accepted manuscript for a single chapter extracted from the full work. This file is distributed under the publisher's terms of use for accepted manuscripts: <u>https://www.springernature.com/qp/open-research/policies/accepted-manuscript-terms</u>. The full book is available from the publisher's website: <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-06604-7</u>



This document was downloaded from https://openair.rgu.ac.uk SEE TERMS OF USE IN BOX ABOVE

Chapter 1: Urbanism at Borders – a Critical Discourse

Quazi Mahtab Zaman¹

Abstract. This opening chapter overviews the purpose of the book. It introduced a global initiative on border urbanism research and interdisciplinary collaboration in 2016, bringing over 28 researchers representing 28 countries to discuss various border-related issues in an international conference 'Urbanism at Borders' held in Aberdeen, Scotland, in 2018. The book is undoubtedly not the first attempt to discuss border issues. However, it is instead the new interest that one might view this book as a sneak-peak of a 'less-explored' subject of border discourse from architecture, urbanism, and other allied disciplines. The chapters in this book collated and demonstrated a renewed interest in the border issue within the built environment discourse. The overview sets the ambition of examining this critical discourse that has already been examined traditionally in various socio-political and related disciplines, which are much advanced and critical.

Nevertheless, the claim that architecture and urbanism do not necessarily intermingle with the border issue originated from the notion that the border subject belongs to a distinct, well-defined political science and allied discipline. Indeed, today we are positioned in the globalised world with more and more interconnected physically and digitally. However, we are in more unstable conditions than many centuries ago. We are subject to the fragility of conflicting ideologies, religion, economy, and the power-politics didactic relationship manifested in the fragility of our habitat and new challenges in restoring social and environmental sustainability.

This book is a snapshot of the vast border issues yet to be researched from architecture and urbanism discourses.

Keywords: Border-Built Environment Nexus, Political Boundaries, Spatial Separation, Polarized Border Cities, Praxis of Border Urbanism, Border Typologies

Background to the emergence of BURC (Border Urbanism Research Centre)

Urbanism at Borders is a global research project conceptualised and initiated in 2016 in Aberdeen, Scotland, at the Scott Sutherland School of Architecture and Built Environment, Robert Gordon University. The initiative began with a global alliance of scholars from architecture and urbanism and a vast continuum of allied subject areas attracted under the Border Urbanism Research Centre (BURC). These scholars represent the fields of human geography, urban design, architecture, trying to look at the issues of spatial justice and migration and urban form, informal and temporal settlement, and urbanism, among many others.

¹ Chair, Border Urbanism Research Centre (BURC), The Scott Sutherland School of Architecture & Built Environment, Robert Gordon University, Aberdeen, United Kingdom

The research and the discussions these scholars are engaged in have underpinned the centre's objective of engaging in specific vanguard research themes on global border urbanism under three discrete and inter-related theoretical frameworks. These are ethnography of transient and dispersed communities, the phenomenology of temporal and spatial experiences, and displacement dynamics. These were addressed under selected working themes: Border Urbanism--the spatial characteristics of temporal communities; ethnography--the vulnerability of marginalised societies; phenomenology--the cultural role of non-places, communal areas, and peripheries; and displacement--forced migration due to natural, economic, political, or migration factors.

Several questions were central to this discussion:

- Are borders socio-politically manufactured conditions?
- Are borders and fragile habitats capable of reflecting the volatility of social, political, or geographical instability?
- Are borders a default social disorder?
- Can border issues be analysed in architecture and urbanism discourses?

Above are some of the ambitions of the BURC. This ambitious discussion gained momentum, and within a year, global scholars assembled and acknowledged that research of borders issues is a critical companion issue of transformative global urbanism and architecture. It is global in latitude and commences from the pervasiveness that every country is confronted with borders.

The subject of borders is manifested in various measurable physical entities and nondiscernible social, political, and human-centred crises. Although the built environment and urbanism disciplines lack the political leverage similar to other relevant disciplines, the 28 researchers brought unique perspectives to the subject of borders based on their experiences and observations from broader and distinct arrays of geographic locations.

Borders have always been the subject of interest as seemingly unexplored research areas from built environment discourse. Nevertheless, there are many apathetic connotations of borders and the cruel ways they have portrayed in socio-economic fragility due to the historical and contemporary migration at the inter-border tensions; the most common reaction to borders is adverse or apprehension. This response is mainly due to the tension, conflict, war, discrimination, social and spatial injustices that are often not a comfortable discussion choice within the built environment discourse.

Conversely, it is undeniable that borders have many positive traits, both factual and metaphorical, that borders provide a basis for contest, which many believe help progress. There is no exchange of goods and services, no mobility, no economic advancement and competition and no progress without borders.

Borders often induce fallacies; they refer to disorder and displacement, resulting in political tussles, social displacement, and resource inequity. The world is geographically more fragmented than thousands of years ago. Revolutions through conflicts and evolution due to newfound lands evolved out of the inconsistency in resources distribution and efficiencies to harness it. Predecessors sequestered by the geographical expanse and absence of mass communication are geographical border-makers. Nevertheless, it was not known to be fragmented, and the geopolitical separation was inevitably a social construct. Most of the debates on border issues appeared in post-modernism, cultural studies, postcolonialism, and ethnic studies framed within space theories. Today's world is closely intertwined through technology and information systems; however, actions and interactions with individuals and how their characteristics are addressed are often prudent and discreet.

Humankind has always been nomadic, crossing borders globally! Three books pose critical questions about the immateriality of borders (Figure 1) and the influence behind the formation of BURC.

Today, the world order, in many ways, integrated having networks of societies once divided by socially constructed norms and differences and focused on the singular premise that borders are a social construct in the conflict of *they and us*. Social conflicts and divisions are inherent in our genetic codes and influence border-making and seek to believe that individuals are not born with a blank slate (tabula rasa) (Pinker, 2002). Displacement due to climate change (Moving with Seasons by Lisa Carter); traditional nomadic life patterns and the transient settlement (Nomads and the Outside world by Anatoly Khazanov); the global ambition for connectivity through the formation of the silk road, breaking the barriers (Lands of Lost Borders by Kate Harris) are some of the works of literature. These books present the position of borders that adds some references to the collective notion of divided cultures and territoriality.



Figure 1: Nomadic beginnings--books that capture ways in which civilisations instinctively developed.

The border is an evaded condition with which we are mentally processed and fostered like 'nature and nurture' of the blank slate ideology mentioned by Pinker (2002). The notion that conflict and social segregation are socially manufactured has roots in the human instinct and originated in genetically coded behaviour. Rasmus Kerrn-Jespersen, in his article' Genes, shape our social, ideological attitude'. Ramus (2016) refers to a statement of a PhD student Camilla Nexøe, from the Department of Political Science and Public Management at the University of Southern Denmark, "My research shows that genes are an important part of individual opinion formation. In particular, the results show that genes influence individual differences in social, ideological orientation". However, 'Most of the variation in political opinion formation is not due to genetics, but some are" (Kerrn-Jespersen, 2016). "Human personality is affected by both genetic and environmental components,," (Nexøe Kerrn-Jespersen, 2016), as in the book Blank Slate by Pinker (2002).

Throughout history, borders have existed in various forms at local and regional levels that created inquisition for explorations and tendencies to connect or enact barriers, among the

many undesirable results of world exploration and colonisation rooted in the distinct set of lands separated culturally, economically and politically. These areas' variable socio-economic and political strength evolved from the differential scarce resources that brought about their early discovery and subsequently other countries' interest to invade. Countries have sustained growth or decline due to their resources and environmental advantages, availability or depletion. Countries like Singapore that lacked physical resources took a creative path to innovation and leveraged intellect to maintain economic advantages. However, much of the development is through cooperation with Malaysia.

The border is a strongly extant element in society. It has been exploited as a political and economic tool; it represents the anxiety of past inhabitants and their descendant's response to complex and problematic border conditions. Future generations are destined to know the social and economic fatalities of a divided and contested world as manifested in the physical differences unknown to many growing children, such as Ciud, ad Juárez, Mexico (figure 2).



Figure 2: Children at the border fence in January, Ciud, ad Juárez, Mexico².

Several research questions guided the discussion of borders in BURC. Some are known, and some are critical for further exploration. These are,

- a. what political economies and social marginalisation with which continents, countries, regions, communities, and locales mediate, evolve into conflicts, segregate races and cultures?
- b. How do fragmented societies end up in fragile settlements, the subject of interest in architecture and urbanism ideologically?
- c. Are socio-economic and resource inconsistency connected to marginalisation in knowledge sharing methods, leading to social supremacy and superpower?
- d. Are these a subject of interest within the discourse of urbanism, architecture, planning and urban design?

The discipline of urbanism and built environment appears distant to the subject of borders. However, the border may not fall within the discourse of urbanism to analyse urban phenomena—but urbanism can be a new methodology to define and analyse the physical aspect

² (Photo: herika martinez/Agence France-Presse/Getty Images, <u>https://www.wsj.com/articles/u-s-stops-separating-immigrant-children-at-border-under-coronavirus-emergency-powers-11585701887</u>, last accessed on 22 May 2021)

of border-induced displacement instead of looking at the politics behind these displacements. It is no doubt that politics is the core driver of displacement. However, there is an opportunity to address other socio-economic and environmental phenomena such as border or borderland's companion issues and consider broader issues such as climate change, ethnicity, economics, and micro-social issues as drivers of displacement and estrangement. These influence movement across borders and within the same geographical region, resulting in gentrification and migration at inter-urban, peri-urban, and urban-rural modes.

Urbanism at Borders and its research collaboration focuses on how the border's physical characterisation may be analysed in the urbanism and architecture discourse. This is a longer-term initiative that the Border Urbanism Research Centre (BURC) will manage various agendas and explore partnerships with a creative and nascent way of networking³.

Section 1: Border-Built Environment Nexus

The association between a border and its neighbouring environment is impacted by the power of mediation of each party linked and affected. Although the environment often influences their rapport, numerous other factors are critical. The chapters in this section examine a variety of border-environment relationships. A wide range of environments, from natural to human-made, are considered against historical events such as cultural and political change-over, natural disasters, and economic development. Many ways borders may instantaneously divide and inexplicably unify; how the relationship may influence future socio-political events serves as an enlightening way to consider relationships between borders and environments. Tim Marshall accrued figurative narratives of ten typologies of borders exemplified through maps that justify political beliefs worldwide (Marshall, 2021). On a different discussion: how future politics will be dominated and the appearances of various class divisions and religion will aggravate the fragmentation of civilisation is now felt throughout the world. The September 11, 2002, symbolises the condescension based on ideological conflict- all are down to the core socio-political differences displayed in the religious aphorisms. Samuel Huntingting was right in 1996! Huntington's thesis that anticipated conflicts arise from cultural and religious individualities, defined as the post-Cold War world (Huntingon, 1996). Nevertheless, what interests urban researchers is the fragility inflicted at those territoriality and how the architecture of fragmentation appears to be the true reflection of the 'clash of civilisations'.

³ Home | Urbanism at Borders: Global Research Group (urbanismatbordersglobalresearchgroup.com)



Figure 3: Two vital books: Prisoners of Geography and The Clash of Civilisations

Political judgments or misjudgements often manipulate or controls the shape of borders. Nevertheless, the political definition of a border is different from how borders are defined in social, humanity, and even economic terms. Thus, politics is a vital tool to understand the formation of borders, a function of differential resource-sharing associations in a default geomorphological setting; it is the difference that empowers one country over others, as Marshall (2015) introduces in *Prisoners of Geography*. He further elaborated (Marshall, 2015, pp. 6) that world geography has always shaped individuals and societies, how individuals confront one another, and how power and politics continually shape social development (Figure 3).

In "Territory and Water Landscape," Carme Carcaño Zapata, Isabel Castiñeira Palou, and Alona Martínez Perez (pp. __) discuss a range of natural boundaries and ways in which nature has created default border attributes over time. Through studies, Zapata et al. (2018) subsequently recognise the causal effects of the border on urban development, delineation, separation, and distinction, through destruction to rebuild with renewed socio-spatial characteristics. She points to natural disasters in the Catalan cities of Sabadell and Terrassa, where over 400 residents died in the 1962 floods. They describe in this chapter the strength of human endeavour to act against the destruction and the interest for rebuilding the city that 'may be transformed to unite disparate areas.' The regional survey methodology of Patrick Geddes (Geddes, 1915) is introduced and considers layers of historical heritage, topography and meteorology, the morphology of the territory, and economic processes. The regional survey is an integral part of geography as a social practice and the particular geographical imagination suggested by regional surveys. Besides, she pointed to Enric Batlle's construction of the territory, embracing three points of view: i) ecology, ii) landscape and iii) town planning, as Enric's practice explains.

Natural disasters are likely to exacerbate natural boundaries, seen throughout history and contemporary geographical cases. It is also true that natural disasters can unite urban areas that were previously separated. According to the National Geography (2021), "With sea level rising and ice caps melting, it is easy to believe that more of Earth's land is covered by water every year. While this is undoubtedly real in some places, a new study found marginally more land surface uncovered than 30 years ago."

Boundaries and the power of boundaries as catalysts for the transformation of paired border cities are considered in **Rüya Erkan's chapter**, "Typology of Boundaries and Their Effects on Paired Border Cities" (pp. ____). Erkan uses the general definition of two classifications,

human-made and *natural*, which provides a broader platform to generate the essential treatise to further argue on the division and reunification as a function of boundaries, emphasising the dominating *paired borders*. How borders affect the different paired border cities worldwide is explained along with how they are depicted in various analyses based on divisive or unifying, partitioning or duplicating, alienation, coexistence, and integration. Finally, Erkan discusses the impact of boundaries on border cities, taking historical, cultural, social, political, and economic stances to comprehend border conditions influential in forming paired cities.

This study adds to previous studies of Németh et al. (2013), which focused on the various methodology of identifying border typologies, described as a) *Ulysses*: a research project (ULYSSES project 2010-2012) that studied the development of European cross-border areas (CBA); b) EU Border Regions⁴.; c) *The Unfamiliarity project*⁵ is focused on the opinions and motivations of people both as influencing factors and as outcomes of cross-border interactions (CBC, flows and international or bilateral relations); d) *Terco*, similar to Ulysses⁶, targeting "international territorial cooperation" interpretation "border-crossing" from greater distances; e) *EU border regions*, studied different sections of the European Union's external borders through eleven case studies. EU Border Regions main objectives are to advise the "neighbourhood policy (or policies)" of the European Union (Németh et al. 2013).

In "The Boundaries of Heritage: The Paradoxes of Ouro Preto (pp..)," Ricardo Ali Abdalla discusses the significance of cultural heritage – its values and meanings eroded amid the industrial revolution and due to the crux that society faced in between new technology and vanishing traditional methods.

Modernism touched every facet of life, and the adoption of modernity and the new revolution of buildings techniques are at the border between traditionalism and post-modernism. Taking Ourto Preto as a world heritage site, Ricardo expresses the utter concern of losing the historical footprint amid innovation and shifting paradox in building technologies that choose not to support heritage rather the uptake of standardised contemporary detached from traditionalism.

"Regional Architecture in the Persian Gulf: Conflicting Architectural Narratives of Global-local Border Convergence," by Ben Tosland (pp. ___) considers regionalism within the Persian Gulf during the twentieth century. It informs the architecture of the Persian Gulf rather than each nation-state, contrary to current historiographical thought. International borders are explored to describe architectural development within the region. Moreover, geopolitical events influence the geographic shift of expansion and intensification of a regional aesthetic. The borderless information age has contributed to shaping 21st century architecture in the Gulf Region. The Persian Gulf has quickly embraced architecture's globalised language through international star architects. Further, global capitalism is triggering a significant transformation in architectural design that questions the implication of this rapid change to climate change, ecological sustainability, and cultural identity. Regionalism is somewhat

⁴ In Eu Border Regions, the eleven case studies are located along different sections of the external border of the European Union, and one of its main objectives is to advise the "neighbourhood policy (or policies)" of the European Union

⁵ As found in the reference of Nemeth et al. (2013) UNFAMILIARITY project (2010-2013), Unfamiliarity as signs of European times: scrutinizing historical representations of *otherness* and contemporary daily practices in border regions, funded by: Academy of Finland, Finland; The Danish Council for Independent Research – Humanities, Denmark; Research Foundation Flanders, Belgium; Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research, The Netherlands; the European Science Foundation, http://www.unfamiliarity.eu/

⁶ Terco focused on the relationship between cross-border co-operation and regions' development

decomposed in the global style and trends, demanding a hybrid and instant city with eclectic architectural language.

Gulazi and Fraser (2013) researched the comprehensive language of architecture and urbanism in the Persian Gulf, drawing very eloquently the human settlement profile concerning environmental factors and particularity of place has been transforming. Globalisation is also given the primary catalyst, which Ben Tosland has given in his chapter.

In "Experiencing Authenticity Through Cultural Borders and Experimental Ethnography" (page ____), Mehwish Abed discusses ethnographic research. She explains that borders are a geographical statement and bear the meaning of a socio-spatial entity. Moreover, borders reflect the subcultures in a multicultural condition that transcend geographic boundaries. Individual interpretation of the symbols of borders often results in segregation and marginalisation. As Haselsberger (2014) stated, borders affect the inner city and people and can be narrated by 'overlapping geopolitical, socio-cultural, economic and biophysical layers, a bordering process. Is the process definable? Abed touched on the non-measurable border and explained that ethnographic geography might be useful as a method for unpacking the socio-cultural meaning of borders. This research highlights that people can experience cultural borders that indicate the city's authenticity through experimental ethnography.

Christos Kakalis investigates several sacred rituals associated with the commemoration of Saint George on the Island of Prinkipos (Büyükada), the largest of the so-called Princes' Islands in "Urban Liminality: Negotiating Borders and the Pilgrimage to the Monastery of St. George Koudounas" (page ____). Kakalis presents a closer examination of the pilgrimage to the monastery of St. George Koudounas on the day of Saint George's commemoration (23rd April). Kakalis addresses the importance of a liminal place to describe the topography of our understanding of religious rituals that transcends through ephemeral phases beyond one's beliefs on sacred physicality.

The word "liminal" emanates from the Latin root 'limen', which means "threshold." - the "crossing over" space. The liminal space is where one has left something behind in a physical term yet not wholly entered in something else. It is transient or temporal compared to the transition space in one's life and the mental sphere. The work of Casey (1993) highlights a shift from ambiguous space to meaningful place; in organisational life, this means a sense of space/materiality/work nexus. In border discourse, Liminality is an idyllic lexicon that portrays the transitory depiction and movement of exodus and coerced transposition, leaving behind an ephemeral spatial experience.

Section 2: Political Boundaries and Spatial Separation

Political boundaries demarcate physical areas. These may have recognisable boundaries defined by natural forms such as bodies of water or topographical features. On the other hand, these areas may be defined by abstract and non-physical boundaries that require measurement and interpretation to quantify and qualify their location. Regardless of their form and origin, political borders exert control over resources by defining the limits of political power and ideologies. Examining political boundaries and how they leverage policies, economies, societies, cultures, religions, and histories examined in this section expand an understanding of political borders and their historical and contemporary impact on spatial separation for a wide range of objectives.

In "Borders for Peace: Controls within a Kenyan Informal Settlement - During Political Conflict" (page ____), Stephen Vertigans, Neil Gibson and Natascha Mueller-Hirth define various barriers to peace. Political boundaries that separate conflicting groups in informal

settlements are often ineffective in preventing violence during contentious political events. Community-based initiatives can contribute to deeper understanding between groups, increase social control, and restrict the potential for political tension. Political tension is prevalent during the election in the informal settlement as a bordered community within a larger community.

Vertigans, Gibson and Mueller-Hirth use the case of Kibera in Nairobi in 2017, drawing from the incident of 2008 when many people were killed in the post-election conflict. An election is a tool for luring informal settlers in many developing nations to obtain votes, resulting in conflict from the underlying tension between various lobbying groups. Differences between this urban area, neighbouring golf course, and middle-class residential gated enclaves are immediately apparent (Figure 4). The urban land share is not harmonious and reflects the lack of planning control. A qualitative fieldwork method was employed: photovoice, semistructured interviews and focus groups to enable participants to share insights into their experiences through photographs and words. The outcome suggests that the younger generation can mediate and neutralise conflict.



Figure 4: The turmoil, uproar, and compactness of the slum are precisely set against the methodical tranquil Royal Nairobi Golf Club, which opened in 1906. (source: Miller, 2016, https://unequalscenes.com/nairobi)

The younger generation is more resilient than the rest of the informal settlers. They are the instrument for negotiation, better understanding Kibera's barriers to peace and exercising peace between opposing political and ethnic groups. This highlights a similar pattern in developing nations – where the younger generation is powerful in transforming tough decisions through demonstration yet has the method to negotiate.

Chiew Hui Tan and Simone Chung show how infrastructure impacts geographic borders in **"Malaysia-Singapore Geopolitics Spatialised: The Causeway as a Palimpsest"** (page ____). Infrastructure in Malaysia and Singapore is critical to economic and historical development on both sides, as goods and services and the migrant workforce manage the services of Singapore daily. Border, in this case, filters a controlled movement for the benefit of Singapore's economic growth using the infrastructure as a conduit of economic transaction and development momentum on both sides. Taking mobility as an essential part of Malaysia-Singapore development, Singapore gains more than Malaysia due to the well-established baseline of good

governance and being a global player of trades and services. In this scenario, the border in these South Asian neighbouring countries facilitates trade relations, but not a conflict.

In "Borders of Precincts: Unpacking the Politics of White Neighbourhood Identities in the Post-Apartheid Black City" (page...), Denver Hendricks and Alona Martínez Perez debate the racial relationships and fear and how these two dynamics impact land distribution and influence the interpretation of government policies. There are ways in which borders can be politically leveraged and undermine public participation in community planning. Post-Apartheid Black City are the crux of clustering settlement collaged in white-neighbourhood, where contradiction of political thought process and contrasting development points to the question of community consensus in any development initiative.

Hendricks and Perez introduced a city-funded *bottom-up* approach. The Johannesburg Development Agency (JDA) funded a Community Participatory Design (CPD) project, the Melville Precinct Plan. They discuss the Melville Residents Association (MRA) initiative helped voice a different opinion about how the urban area is envisioned concerning the Strategic Area Framework (SAF) set out by the City of Johannesburg. Analysis of the MRA stems from the enquiry on what kind of development is essential on the city's borders, what fears are synonymous with that, and what unfair and exclusionary practice? The research on Melville Precinct Plan focuses on its framing policies and the general outcomes to unpack how the borders, peripherals and edges are used politically to undermine generous public participation processes in planning a new community vision.

Various factors influenced India's shift from hard power to soft power diplomacy in Nepal. Suraj Paneru considers these issues in "India's Shift to Soft Power in Nepal: a Case Study of the Borderland City of Birgunj" (page ____) and points to the key factors that influence the development of Nepal through the Indian 'Soft Power' includes the political use of a border to enforce the policy. However, there are historical ties in terms of cultural and religious similarities.

The context of Birgunj, where the 2015 Indian economic blockade on Nepal, is examined. Five key factors influenced India's shift from hard power to a soft power policy: internationalisation of the Nepal conflict, the opening of border transit and construction of roads to China, trade agreement and the One Belt One Road (OBOR) initiative, interpretation of Indian governmental activities and India's political situation.

These conditions are the function of a landlocked country and are similar to those addressed in "Regional Features of Agglomeration and the Antidote to Almaty's Landlocked Condition" (page __). In this chapter, Gulnara Nyussupova, Aisulu Kalimurzina, Roza Kelinbayeva, Shnar Kairova, and Laura Kenespayeva assess the landlocked city of Almaty its development anomalies due to Kazakhstan's landlocked condition. The authors discuss the need to establish a parameter to guide innovative use of infrastructure to achieve regional ambitions of transportation corridor and investment to achieve potential on developing science, quality of life, and urban development to compensate for the disadvantages of being a landlocked country. Landlock Kazakhstan depends on regional interactions, and the infrastructure is an integral part of the economic development that contradicts many neighbouring countries.

Almaty, the former capital of Kazakhstan, advances as a prosperous city due to the ongoing influx of working-age population, highly qualified personnel with a traditionally well-developed educational base and enriched by national ambition and some degree national-target to maintain an intellectual environment. Kazakhstan breaks the boundary of landlocked conditions by reaching out to various developed countries to partner with its development.

Almaty has a long history as the epicentre of science and innovation. This relates to the previous chapter on Nepal – and the range of lessons to be learnt – where education becomes a strategic focus and the critical resource that potentially brings other prosperities.

In "People Places and Relationships" (page ___), Vaidehi Raipat, points to the need for human-centric urban design without which socio-cultural fragmentation is inevitable. Underpinning five basic urban design dimensions - people, places, networks, activities and territoriality, Vaidehi analysed the character of Ranchi in India. The city's urbanisation and radical plan for expansion affected the ecosystem. While the city's fabric could not take the growing demand of new technology-based societal needs. The polarities in Ranchi originated from traditionalism, and another craving for the contemporary socio-economic demand left fractured urban conditions. The chapter addresses the strategic ways of embracing the conventional user participation to register the views and observation can be the antidote to the urban fracture conditions,

Section 3: Polarized Border Cities

The linear boundary between different areas is often transected by a line of transit that conveys people, resources, goods, and information. A concentration of activity, a permanent or temporal border city, often develops at this intersection. These chapters examine this phenomenon in the specific context of historical borders and artificial borders, and borders of inequity and urgency. Each analysis outlines valuable insights applicable to cases and environments beyond each environment's scope and leads to new ways to identify and consider borders that separate and divide otherwise unified areas and groups.

In "Border[s]lines Between Isolation and Connection," Cecillia Zecca and Richard Laing (page ___) explore the connection between disused railway and society. Abandoned railways as a contradictory function of border and connection. Case studies are used to explore how urban linear connections define linear inert space and become a socio-spatial statement – differing two sides of the line as distinguishable.

Urban infrastructures are dynamic and result in relocated railway lines, leaving a void in urban areas that can be leveraged as a connecting area rather than a divisive one. Disused space, being *non-spaces* (reference), can become creatively helpful for any society should be a collaborative professional, and social engagement is exercised. Views and experiences with creative intervention into empty, non-space and social intervention are presented.

Sam Vardy and Paula McCloskey present ways in which borders can resist sovereign historical territories and territoriality in "Fragile Cartographies of Border Fictioning" (page _____). The issue of displaced social vulnerability and survival tactics are examined through research and their viewpoints. Transient minorities in hyper vulnerability face variable and contoured anxiety and risks of living in unsafe and unhealthy places. Relocating from unsafe environments and ensuring housing, providing stability, preventing a humanitarian crisis, protecting from natural disasters, and helping to avoid expulsion are challenging strategies every country faces. In temporal life, the adaptation of the unforeseeable challenges is immense.

In "**Dissonant Living and Building in the No-Man's land on the Korean peninsula**" (page ???), **Hyun-Tae Jung** illustrated the underlying conflicts, primarily historical and known worldwide, as the source of regional intensely political volatility since the end of the Korean War during the years 1950-53. 'The Korean Armistice Agreement' of 1953 formed the Korean Demilitarized Zone (DMZ) to lessen immediate conflicts between the two sides flanked by 250

kilometres long and approximately 4 kilometres wide, serving as a buffer between two countries.

Moriah Snowden, in "Displaced: Vulnerability and Survival Within Segregated Undercaste Micro-Cultures" (page ____) focuses on humanitarian programs that connect to transient minorities as a marginal segment of the society who are in a state of hyper-vulnerability. The crisis on this migrant diConstant relocation of these groups from unsafe environments resulting from humanitarian crises or housing instability leaves a disproportionate segment of this population with inadequate housing or temporary shelter.

Despite the best efforts of relief organisations, some disenfranchised and displaced groups view humanitarian outreach as a last resort and opt to meet their needs independently. Too often, these minorities are cast in a pitiable light and viewed as separate from the macrosocieties they are apart. In this way, the border that defines these groups is a state of being rather than a drawn boundary.

Snowden explores the adaptation of the compromise. It addresses how marginalised minority populations that reject the larger society can sustain themselves outside conventional economic sectors. It draws upon volunteer experience with Habitat for Humanity between 2005 and 2009 and first-hand accounts and statistical data of outreach to groups seeking asylum. These efforts are part of an ongoing examination of under-caste micro-communities in Lebanon and the US (Puerto Rico and Georgia) shunned within the greater macro-societies.

Chiara Toscani, in **"Trailblazing of European Ideal,"** (page ____) considers the political history and its economic and political relationships. According to Toscani, the border represents the division between an economy of wealth and one without prosperity. The border represents an opening toward a new economic exchange that can be extended to social and political benefits.

Toscani uses Frankfurt (Oder) and Slubice – the twin cities separated by the Iron Curtain⁷ that symbolises the urban and social context in the European Union. These twin cities are the testament to two adverse situations of the Iron Curtain, despite the disadvantage on the Eastern part, the same border signifying the gateway toward a new economic trade among Berlin, Frankfurt, and other Polish. The gateway allows a one-way journey to prosperous countries, Germany and the United Kingdom. However, it does not reverse the process. Toscani brings in governance and infrastructure development to prevent the one-way flow of immigrants.

The city of Ceuta, a much-discussed Spanish border settlement located on the north coast of Africa, provides means for **Guido Cimadomo** to address an unfolding migrant border crisis in **"Spatial Transformations in Ceuta, Spain: Effects of a Low-Density Hinterland on a Border Enclave"** (page ____). The issue has its roots in a long-running conflict about 2,000 kilometres (1,242 miles) away. Ceuta falls in the versatility of culture and socio-politics shaped by the European Union and Africa together with another Spanish-controlled city Melilla over the last 400 years (Figure 5). Although Ceuta has no physical land connection to the EU, the border is a unique context with which Ceuta has of Spain been transforming throughout its possession from Morocco.

⁷ According to Britannica, the term Iron Curtain originated for occasional and varied purposes, mainly as a metaphor since the 19th century. This term became prominent after it was used by former British prime minister Winston Churchill in a speech at Fulton, Missouri, U.S., on March 5, 1946, when he said of the communist states, "From Stettin in the Baltic to Trieste in the Adriatic, an iron curtain has descended across the Continent." (Britannica, The Editors of Encyclopaedia. "Iron Curtain". Encyclopedia Britannica, Invalid Date, https://www.britannica.com/event/Iron-Curtain. Accessed 24 June 2021.)



Figure 5 (source: Polisario Front - Wikipedia, accessed on 10 October 2021)

Morocco's decision not to recognise Ceuta impacts the development and demographic density along the Moroccan side of the border. However, any movement of goods and people is controlled by written and unwritten laws that make it a permeable membrane in one aspect and a strong barrier that limits the undesired flows originating from south-north migrations. The central issue is the potential for development on the Moroccan side, which denotes social and spatial justice having less access to resources and lack of development opportunities. Cimadomo took all these factors into his research and postulated a 'centripetal strategies/ aiming to densify and upgrade the built environment addressing various social and political conflicts. Spanish-Moroccan disputed Polisario Front (Popular Front for the Liberation of Saguia el-Hamra and Río de Oro) is the inflicted global narratives - some from Germany and other critical questions from the former Trump regime USA - which are based on other global interests on the EU's approach to Ceuta.

Section 4: Praxis of Border Urbanism

In reality, borders are often elements that unify rather than separate. In cases where the boundary limits unification that may be desired, there are ways to leverage the border as a coalescing element or, at a minimum, reduce its ability to divide. As presented by the chapters in this section, the potential to connect rather than isolate requires an understanding of the context, its history, and the issues that led to its creation. The disparate qualities of the border areas can be used to change its function. In addition, the physical characteristics of the border itself are often more critical than the areas, populations, and resources that it separates. Considered in these ways, borders can be leveraged to overcome and even modify future trajectories accepted as static or unchangeable.

Borders may be transient. Considered against the timeline of history, borders may be a decisive factor in determining how individuals define their population and identify themselves. In many cases, multiple borders may simultaneously define different aspects of a physical area. Instead of being contradictory or competing, these boundaries may reinforce the legitimacy of other borders as they adapt to and respond to historical change.

Chapters in this section take an array of borders and boundaries and examine them concerning their unique political, cultural, and symbolic histories.

Rima Abousleiman, in **"Programmed Spaces: Redefining the Border Condition"** (page), presents the ideology that for some countries, a border is an opportunity for *junctures of unification* rather than *barriers of separation*. The inter-political powers portray Borders as an imaginary line as it forms on the geographical map. However, its meaning often embraces the opportunity of meeting places of languages, cultures, and cuisines, the possibilities for positive vision, which Rima postulates. This is a position ascertained and a utopian in some sense that is a desire for many. Nevertheless, Abousleiman goes beyond the pragmatic definition of borders by portraying the desolate expanses of landscape maintained as a political instrument. Abousleiman proposed a potential program to draw people in, engage with them, and, consequently, activate a once undesirable space, perhaps a cultural hub combining language, art, music, and food, providing the opportunity to offer a spatial and placemaking value.

This is regarded as an emergent tertiary space as a non-existential space, given by the 'Blue "Blue Neutralized Zone" as an example by the designer Soyoun Kim. Abousleiman also discusses the US-Mexico and West Bank borders in helping the theoretical debate. The Blue Neutralized Zone is a collective desire from both sides of Korea, and Abousleiman proposed a similar but more shared public realm that would unite rather than separate two cultures.

Abousleiman discusses a vision of designer Soyoun Kim naming "Blue Neutralized Zone" using the demilitarised zone (DMZ). Creating a sense of community in this neutral zone helps places foster a tertiary space that is neither here nor there but perfectly balanced interactions. One of the examples from 25 visions of Soyoun Kim is the Swimming Pool at the DMZ – which is highlighted in the Blue Neutralized Zone. The underlying objective of generating these visions rests on the belief in reintroducing the association between South and North Korea as an agreeable reality, probably even leading to the ambition for unanimity.

In "Interrogating 'Post-conflict' Regeneration: A New Border in Northern Ireland" (page), Orla McKeever begins with the question of whether repressive constraints, relating to the legacy of conflict, exist within the design of civic regeneration projects and if so, how do they manifest within the public realm. McKeever explores whether repressive constraints relating to the legacy of conflict exist within the design of civic regeneration projects and how they manifest within the public realm? Similarly, as the Nolli maps of Rome (1736-48) chart civic buildings' publicly accessible interior space as an extension of the public realm, this question will be explored by investigating a civic case study project.

Finally, the threshold condition will be investigated as a critical moment in the facilitation or the obstruction of an extension of the public realm while exploring the *choreography of daily life*. (Farrell and McNamara, 2018).⁸ Documented site visits reveal the immaterial repressive methods and material elements--signals within the built environment that control, contain and corral the use of regeneration projects and facilitate new borders within the *post-conflict* environment of Northern Ireland.

US-Mexico border issues are addressed in a new context by **Richard Murray** in "Cartographic Errors" (page ____). Issues of socio-economic and cultural conflicts in the USA resulting from divided communities from this age-old border dispute are considered. In addition, Murray provides an alternate view of the potential to consider the border issue away from the traditional context and consider ways to bridge cultural divisions with individual recognition of other cultures.

Murray uses The Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity, bringing a new interpretation of Milton Bennett (Bennett, 2004), arguing a shift of mono-culture to intercultural mindset to mediate differences and segregation. Murray sees the mediation technique as an architectural project with a sense of multiculturalism that could be sowed into children's minds through creative education settings.

According to Murray, 'Architecture cannot directly address cultural polarisation. Instead, the success of bridging cultural divisions begins with individual recognition of other cultures and is achieved by a collective movement towards awareness and appreciation.' This is perhaps the root cause of socially-induced views on cultural polarities –negative connotations of differing cultural dynamism.

Yehya M. Serag, in "Towards an Appropriate Development Approach for the Halayeb-Shalateen Border Region of Egypt" (page ___) discusses the triangular region Halayeb-Shalateen in southeast Egypt that borders Sudan. The political struggle with Egypt and Sudan on the issue of administration and sovereignty echoes other similar struggles in many parts of the world. A critical transition in the British Colonization needed compression due to the dispute between Egypt and Sudan during the last quarter of the 19th century and the first half of the 20th century.

The regime in Egypt has controlled the demography in Egypt as control over their population moving to Sudan that has lasted since the July 1952 revolution. For this, the Aswan High Dam during the 1960s acted as a physical control tool reducing cross-border interaction and trade that had previously helped strengthen border relations.

Recently, the Four Freedoms Agreement of 2004 suggested these two nations implement the bilateral movement of people and goods. The lessons are drawn as political acts implied through various physical and institutional regulatory systems (Mohyeldeen, 2020).

In "Contested Border Urbanism: Learning from the Cyprus Dispute" (page ____), Melehat Nil Gülari and Cecilia Zecca address the ideas of *space*, *place* and *identity* in the context the meaning of borders for Cypriots living in the north part of Cyprus, which is part of the Turkish Republic, and in the south, which is under Greek control. In considering the conflicting ethnic relationship, they trace the meaning of walls and borders by examining the urban fabric in Nicosia, Europe's last divided capital, and the narratives of crossing borders when closed borders were reopened after three decades.

⁸ Farrell, Y., McNamara, S.: "La Biennale Di Venezia 16th International Architecture Exhibition Curated", <u>http://files.cargocollective.com/159426/1.-Press-Release-16.-International-Architecture-Exhibition---La-Biennale-di-Venezia.pdf</u>, last accessed 2018/06/27.

Section 5: Geo-Politics and Social Polarities

The most critical impact of borders is upon people who inhabit the demarcated areas, identified, or separated. In many cases, the people who live and work in these areas were not responsible for the border's creation and enforcement. These people may have been attracted to the area by the qualities of the border created. On the other hand, the border may have been created to isolate them, their activities, and the characteristics that define them as a group—cultural, religious, political and most often economic. In the latter case, people are disadvantaged by the reality of the border and the basis for its enforcement. This final section presents a range of cases in which the incongruity between borders and the reality of their contexts is examined for ways that the border can be a path to resolve disparity and differences rather than reinforce it.

Luke Murray and Lilly Kudic explore approaches to landscape using the Yorkshire Dales in Swaledale as a case study in "Walk the Line: Stone Walls, Lead Mines and Future Farming" (page ____). The Yorkshire Dales are well-known for prehistoric dry stone wall and mining history: currently have no significance in today's society, except for tourism purposes. The traces of path traversed by the miners from Gunnerside to The Old Gang Mine generate research interest for Murray and Kudic and they question whether the landscape can offer insight into past acts, present attitudes, and future ambitions.

The research intends to reveal the historical significance moments, mainly 'The Inclosure Act' passed throughout the 1600–the 1700s. Parliamentary Inclosure and Industrialists' land holdings represented the times' political, social and economic authority, central to land and regional divisions seen through Great Britain. This is relevant to historical landscapes today, except for tourism. However, the landscape can offer insight into past acts, present attitudes, and future agriculture ambitions in the United Kingdom.

In "Borders of Convenience: European Legal Measures and the Migration Crisis" (page), Paul Arnell and Carole Lyons discuss the migration crisis concerning the European institutions, debating on whether the reality of European Union (EU) human rights matches its rhetoric. The EU's reaction to the crisis has adopted new external borders and responded to the jurisdictional extension of human rights protection by the European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR). Arnell and Lyons analysed underlying differences within the EU's response to the crisis and the ECtHR to re-impose responsibility on European states.

In many instances, the migrant crisis rests on the label of refugee status only, without taking its vulnerability likely to face when deported, which goes against the international human rights framework. The refugee status has been managed and controlled by the jurisdiction's international borders. However, it is widely agreed by the European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) and other similar human rights organisations, such as Freedom for Torture (UK), Amnesty International UK - aiming to assist in uniting displaced families and safeguard human rights against the UK government policies at large These recommendations from individual counties and the unions, are often eliminate and ignores the human rights obligations proposed and advocated by the United Nations' NGO committee for migration in the document: A Call for a human-rights-based approach to migration and development in the 2008 Global Forum on Migration and Development (GFMD) (The UN Org, 2020).

Samira Albia and Rosa Cervera consider transient settlements in "Indian Slums: The Boundary of Socially Constructed Temporal Borderlands. The Case of Nagar, Wazirpur, Jijamata Nagar Micro-cities" (page ____). Albia and Cervera establish the contemporary notion of the temporal and transient form of settlements which are the product of the socially and economically constructed form of settlement, through the case of India. This formation is associated with industrialisation and the policy changes emphasising the economic growth that concentrates on a few social groups leaving behind the marginalised group of settlers who migrated from rural to urban areas. However, the conventional policy of the government is to stabilise the formation of slums. However, it becomes a far-cry objective for an overpopulated country with an imbalanced distribution of jobs. The authors analysed three specific slums to examine the different scales, the internal structures and the morphologies of the settlements: the slum of Anna Nagar, located next to the airport of Secunderabad; the slum of Wazirpur, located in a large industrial area of Delhi; and the slum of Jijamata Nagar in Mumbai, with the help of graphical methods. The research findings demonstrate how the inhabitants of each slum congregate daily in a self-regulated socio-economic and physical formation.

In "A Neighbourhood of Fragmentation and Isolation (page ____), Iris Altenberg uses Scotland to illustrate regeneration and the measures against gentrification. A case study of the Raploch Council housing estate in Stirling, Scotland, once isolated as a bordered neighbourhood, is achieved with the gentrification outcome and policy in mind, encouraging increased owner-occupation in an area previously dominated by social housing. In addition, new customary design values are reflected in the semiotics of architecture by creating a new language of building for new residents replacing the social housing tenants.

An *auto-driven photo-elicitation method* (PEI) was used by the area's new residents, giving them single-use cameras to take photos of the places and spaces that illustrate the changing nature of Raploch. Shaw (2013) suggests that differential opinions could be generated by enabling personal control and empowerment with a subsequent one-to-one interview. The marginalised societies might bring content into interviews that are not apparent from the observation or secondary data research (Clark-Ibáñez, 2004; Guillermin & Drew, 2010).

The interviews focused on the participants' photos. It became clear that there were social boundaries between the established residents and the new residents, resulting in an 'us' and 'them' discourse. These social discrepancies were expressed in the physical barrier of a road stretching between these two groups' areas, further amplified by the architectural character. Each group considered the other as either 'out of place' in the established residents or as 'old' with an underlying discourse of needing redevelopment by the new residents.

Austin Williams narrates the reflective documentary of social changes taking place on the fringes of Suzhou, Jiangsu Province, China in "Edge Town / Che Fang" (page ____). The rapid development in China has its roots in globalisation. Social transformation is at its highest rate over the last decades, and these changes made borders of differential growth patterns within the province. Williams uses a case study of a town close to Suzhou's industrialised area that was in the process of being transformed until the work was interrupted, resulting in a division in the community into three distinct areas. Wu (2015) indicates that new redevelopment in Chinese cities has dire consequences on societies due to the state's intervention in informal areas that turn into new production spaces for revenue maximisation.

Edge Town/ Che Fang features interviews with a range of people living on the edge of the city's urban development that illustrates their memories and thoughts for the future. This state-run redevelopment has a long track record of the deterioration of the neighbourhood,

including gentrification. As a result, marginalised communities become at the threshold of urban borders generated by the force of real estate investment. On the other hand, the enduring transformation in mainland China is linked to extreme socio-economic and political adjustments, shifting the way of living for many urban and rural dwellers living in poverty. The transformation of old and dilapidated neighbourhoods into modern, commoditised space forcibly produces marginalised societies. Since the 1980s, various reform measures have been centred on leading homeownership through the commodification of urban housing(Wang and Murie 1999a; Zhou and Logan 2002).

Section 6: Border Typologies Investigated

The subject of the border is not so widespread or does not fascinate researchers in architecture or urbanism. Nevertheless, the discourses of architecture and urbanism generally trace the nature of borders or boundaries in exploring architectural development options or placemaking. Professionals mediate boundary in architecture or urban design as border or borderland of direct connection to influencing factors. This practice emerges as a critical instrument with which decisions on land development dictate both histories and contemporary societies.

A collection of research by RIBA Part 2 students at the Scott Sutherland School of Architecture and Built Environment outline analysis and research of typologies of boundary in social, economic, cultural domains.

In "Border Typologies Investigated" (page ____), Andrew Pacitti gathers a range of border conditions graphically both inland and air, territorial and neighbouring countries. These are pictorial but self-narrative. Finally, Patric Sim presents the explorative research on the globalisation of transactions of goods and services in "Chinese Trade Boundary: Immersion Into the World Economy" (page ____). Sim focuses on the Chinese global market economy, shaping worldwide consumption trends. The strength of production capacity drives this global phenomenon as China became the sole producer. At the same time, Europe and North America were the largest consumers, creating a more extensive global network of borderless enterprises (Figure 6).



Figure 6: Comparative scenario of China's trades in and out of the country in 2016 (Patrick Sim, 2018)

Mathew Holmes reframes the popular cultural precincts of Chinatowns in "The Rhetoric of Ethnicity and Borderlands" (page ____). Holmes describes an evolutionary process that gradually dissolves into the foreign cultural enclave. Chinatown makes a distinct feature in the alien landscape by its exotic food and services as a landmark, district and edges (boundary), taking Kevin Lynch urban semiotics and 1967 Bob Chan Pictorial Map of San Francisco's Chinatown.

In "Social Segregation and Boundaries of Restrictions" (page ____), Julie Nelson selects from the micro-social landscape where social segregation due to gender, disability, and age can be recognised as boundaries of socially constructed beliefs and norms that existed and are still a social concern. These are qualitatively described in images but have their foundations in the theoretical realm and interpretation that various authors researched in social science, politics and ethnography (Figure 7).



Figure 7: Typologies of social isolation

Andrew Kirwan considers how data and technology shape our world in "**Borderless Society and the Liminal Border**" (page). Kirwan describes how data gathering connects the world and creates a borderless society (Figure 9). The conceptualisation of networks in Manuel Castells' theory of network society predominantly addressed the social dependency on trades, social networking, economy and politics. As a result, in the latter half of the 1990s, the Information Age trilogy became a critical notion of social change and social theory. (Figure 8)



Figure 8: Liminality at the tip of a finger (Kirwan, 2018)

Summary statement of the explorative research

This last chapter is a graphical excursion. Although less methodical, these are being nurtured in the architectural educational realm. However, these illustrations are able, to some extent, to communicate the fundamental nature of how some of the critical border typologies, known to the world, may be the basis for interest in reconnoitring more typologies unfamiliar to us.

The crux of these explorations is a flinch of the attempt or surprising trip to researching border issues from the discipline of architecture. However, more collaboration with the social, political and ethnographic researchers would likely set a culture of probing the border issues using architecture, urban design and urban planning. As stated earlier – the border was less researched in the built environment disciplines in a similar polemical fashion as in political science and other allied disciplines.

Thus, there is a chance for embracing these two distant disciplines, architecture and political or anthropological sciences, to help define the various unknown phenomenon of the formation of borders, their history of displaced settlements, fragile architecture and transient social formation. Some of these are less explored and known sparsely to the discipline of architecture and urbanism. The book will join other significant books and articles so far published to remind us of the need for a transdisciplinary approach to border research.

References

- Casey, E. S. (1993). Getting Back into Place: Toward a Renewed Understanding of the Place-World. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Clark-Ibáñez, M. (2004). Framing the social world with photo-elicitation interviews. American Behavioral Scientist, 47, 1507–1528.
- Geddes, P. (1915) Cities in evolution, Williams and Norgate, London.
- Golzari, N. (2013). Architecture and Globalisation in the Persian Gulf Region. Murray Fraser.
- Guillemin, M., Drew, S. (2010). Questions of process in participant-generated visual methodologies. Visual Studies, 25, 175–188.
- Mason, B (2021), New Map Shows Where Earth Has Gained and Lost Land, National Geography, https://www.nationalgeographic.com/culture/article/water-land-sea-levels-shift-map.
- Matless, D (1992), Regional Surveys and Local Knowledges: The Geographical Imagination in Britain, 1918-39, Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers, New Series, Vol. 17, No. 4 (1992), pp. 464-480.
- Miller, J. (2016). Unequal Scenes Nairobi. Used in the article: https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11482-019-09739-8.
- Shaw, D. (2013). A new look at an old research method: Photo-elicitation. TESOL Journal, 4, 785–799.
- Ulysses project (2010-2012), Using Applied Research Results from ESPON as a Yardstick for Crossborder Spatial Development Planning, funded by the European Commission under the ESPON 2013 Programme,

http://www.espon.eu/main/Menu_Projects/Menu_TargetedAnalyses/ulysses.html.

- Wang, Y. P. and Murie, A (1999b) Housing Policy and Practice in China, London: Macmillan.
- Wu F. (2016). State Dominance in Urban Redevelopment: Beyond Gentrification in Urban China. Urban Affairs Review; 52(5):631-658. doi:10.1177/1078087415612930.
- Wu, Fulong, (ed.) China's emerging cities: the making of new urbanism. Routledge contemporary China series. London, UK : Routledge, 2008, pp. 163-184.
- Zhou, M. and Logan, J. R. (2002). "Market transition and the commodification of housing in urban China," in J. R. Logan (ed.) The New Chinese City: Globalisation and Market Reform, Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 173–152.

Mohyeldeen, S. (2020). The Egypt-Sudan Border: A Story of Unfulfilled Promise, X-Border Local Research Network, Malcolm H. Kerr Carnegie Middle East Center (<u>https://carnegie-mec.org/2020/06/11/egypt-sudan-border-story-of-unfulfilled-promisepub-81995</u>, accessed on 16 October 2021)