AUTHOR(S): AITCHISON, B. and REID, P.H.

TITLE: 'The owner of one of the largest and most valuable private libraries in Scotland': David Hay Fleming as book collector.

YEAR: 2015

Publisher citation: AITCHISON, B. and REID, P.H. 2015. 'The owner of one of the largest and most valuable private libraries in Scotland': David Hay Fleming as book collector. Library and information history [online], 31(2), pages 95-116. Available from: https://doi.org/10.1179/1758348914Z.00000000077

OpenAIR citation: AITCHISON, B. and REID, P.H. 2015. 'The owner of one of the largest and most valuable private libraries in Scotland': David Hay Fleming as book collector. Library and information history, 31(2), pages 95-116. Held on OpenAIR [online]. Available from: https://openair.rgu.ac.uk

‘The owner of one of the largest and most valuable private libraries in Scotland’: David Hay Fleming as book collector

Briony Aitchison, University of St Andrews, and Peter H. Reid, Robert Gordon University.

Abstract
David Hay Fleming, one in a long line of gentlemen scholars, is remembered as an historian, antiquary, and critic. Yet upon his death in 1931 he left his library of nearly 13,000 volumes (together with his personal papers, letters, and notebooks) to the town of St Andrews, to form the nucleus of a public reference library. This paper seeks to place him firmly in the context of a book collector (and reader) through examining the subjects contained within his library, his motivation for acquiring books, and how his library was used both by himself and by others. Ultimately, new light will be shed upon the book collecting habits of a middle-class individual, contributing to our understanding of how books were owned, read, and used in late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Scotland.

Keywords David Hay Fleming, book collecting, book collectors, private libraries, nineteenth century, twentieth century, Scotland

Introduction

On 9th November 1931 an obituary for David Hay Fleming (1849-1931) appeared in *The Scotsman*, where he was described as ‘the owner of one of the largest and most valuable private libraries in Scotland’.[1] As such, it seems only fitting that its owner should be considered in the role of book collector (and user) alongside his more well-known sobriquets of antiquary, historian, and critic.[2] Consisting of nearly 13,000 volumes at the time of his death,[3] his was a library built almost from scratch throughout the course of his life; although a few volumes were inherited from family members, this is a far cry from libraries formed on great inheritances amongst the aristocracy, a section of society, together with major historical or cultural figures, which has received much attention where studies of book collectors are concerned.[4] Hay Fleming belonged to the middle classes; he was a gentleman-scholar, a successful claim on an estate in Chancery in 1876 allowing him to sell the family china and stoneware business in 1883 shortly after his mother’s death in August 1882 (his father had died in 1859).[5] His library is thus representative of a group of upwardly mobile merchants, ministers, and academics who have thus far received scant attention from historians of the private library.[6] Hay Fleming began collecting books in the nineteenth century, a period in which many social and economic shifts took place, and which witnessed increased levels of education, leisure time, and disposable income. As such, he and his library can be seen as being representative of these concerns. Improvements in the printing press meant that more reading matter was available for public consumption, and at a time when evangelical principles were spreading, reading was favoured above pastimes such as concerts or cards. Within such ripe conditions many private libraries were formed, but again these have received little attention from current scholars and researchers.[7] The study of Hay Fleming as a book collector and book user will therefore not only go some way towards redressing the balance which has long prevailed in focusing upon book collectors who belong to the upper echelon of society, or who are major historical or cultural figures, but will also greatly add to our understanding of the way in which books have been owned, read, and used in private libraries of late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Scotland.

Hay Fleming and his library

Born on 9th May 1849 in St Andrews, Hay Fleming was the third of four children, and the youngest son, of John Fleming, china and stoneware merchant, and his wife, Ann Hay. Educated at Madras College, upon leaving school he entered the family business, but sold this in the spring of 1883, following his mother's death the previous August. Shortly after selling the family business Hay Fleming met Robina Agnes Hart, and they married on 9th July 1885. Although there were no children, their marriage was a happy one, and Robina's sudden death on 12th January 1909, grieved Hay Fleming much. On 1st February 1909 he told his friend William Alexander Craigie (1867-1957):

> Under this terrible blow my heart is crushed and my spirit is broken. I have little left to live for now, except my work and for that I have little heart. My loss seems to grow greater day by day. I miss her every day and every hour of the day. We were so much to one another. The house seems very empty and the world seems empty too.[8]

Born and bred in St Andrews, in April 1905 Hay Fleming and his wife moved to Edinburgh, but his home town was not forgotten, for he returned fortnightly to St Andrews, and it was to St Andrews that his body was returned after his death on 7th November 1931, being interred four days later alongside that of his wife at St Andrews Cathedral burial-ground. Such was his love for his home town that in his will Hay Fleming left his books and manuscripts to St Andrews 'for the purpose of founding and maintaining [...] a public reference library, of which my collection of books, pamphlets, engravings and manuscripts shall be taken to form the nucleus'.[9] We are fortunate that Hay Fleming's library is extant, and also that it is supplemented by a wealth of resources: not only do many volumes contain his annotations, but we are also privy to Hay Fleming's personal correspondence, notebooks, and accounts, all of which can be used to build up the picture of Hay Fleming as book collector and book user.

Hay Fleming had an interest in books from an early age. At the age of six he was drawn to 'three stately quarto volumes' on a book stall at the Lammas Market in St Andrews, but being young, and having only sixpence, he 'did not like even to ask the price of them'. Great was his surprise when he arrived home to find that his father, who 'was very fond of history', had purchased these self-same volumes.[10] It was to be another ten years, at the age of 15 in 1865, before Hay Fleming purchased his first book.[11] This was to be his first step in building his library, although it was not until 1879 that serious collecting began, with the purchase of 91 books (prior to this the most books bought in any one year was 43, in 1877). Following the successful claim in chancery in 1876, Hay Fleming began seriously to devote time to his literary career; his first signed article appeared in the *Original Secession Magazine* in 1877, with more appearing in the following years, whilst his first critical review (of J.F.S. Gordon's *Scotichronicon*) appeared in the same magazine in September 1879. It was also around this same time, the late 1870s, that Hay Fleming spent time examining the original documents of St Andrews, the immediate fruit of which was his *Alphabetic Guide Book to St Andrews* of 1881.[12] It seems very probable that the sudden rise in the number of books Hay Fleming purchased in the late 1870s, progressing to the larger purchases from 1879 onwards, was related to these literary endeavours. Hay Fleming himself kept notebooks documenting his purchases between 1891 and 1924, revealing that over this 33 year period 7,488 books were collected – on average 227 per year (although there was clearly a spree between May 1918 and December 1920, when he purchased 812 books).[13]

There are many subject areas to be found in Hay Fleming's library. Most are composed of a small number of books: some 51 items on archaeology, 34 on golf, 34 works of classical authors (including Virgil, Sallust, and Horace), and some 13 on coins. Amongst these subjects we also find works which could be found in many households, such as cookery books and books on home medicine. To own books on a variety of subjects was not unusual for book collectors; Fanny Seward (1844-1866), a privileged girl growing up in New York State, had many subject areas within her library, although her main interests were fiction, religious/inspirational works, and miscellanies/magazines.[14]

Evidence survives which suggests that Hay Fleming himself viewed his library as being composed of different collections. Writing in 1929 to Miss Eliza H. Dowden, a daughter of one of his great friends, Bishop John Dowden (1840-1910), he informed her that he had a copy of R.W. Billing's *Architectural Illustrations: History and Description of Carlisle Cathedral*, 'which is in my collection of Architectural books' – a collection which numbered some 123 volumes at the time of his death in 1931.[15] Hay Fleming had a genuine interest in architecture, having absorbed himself from early youth in the relics, ruins, and architectural remains of St Andrews and the surrounding regions, and the topic was one upon which he corresponded with others; in 1923 both John Bilson and R.B. Strachan corresponded with Hay Fleming over the foundations of St Rule's Tower and whether there was an apse.[16] Whether Hay Fleming physically divided his library into different subject areas, or only did so mentally, we may never know; but certainly his books on Queen Mary and John Knox 'were preserved in a room which he always kept carefully locked'.[17] One reason for this may have been that they were figures in subjects close to his heart – Scottish history and the (Scottish) Reformation. His library contained some 228 books on Mary, Queen of Scots, with many early editions, including George Conn's *Vita Mariae Stuartae* (Rome, 1624) and Jacques Melvil's two volume *Memoires Historiques* (Lyon, 1694), whilst there were some 121 books concerned with John Knox. Hay Fleming's books on the Reformation more generally numbered some 274 volumes, with some 92 books and 16 pamphlets published in the sixteenth century.[18]

Another of Hay Fleming's interests was Covenanting times. In 1638 a National Covenant was signed at Greyfriars Kirk, Edinburgh, a document which sought to defend Presbyterianism against the efforts of the monarch to Anglicise the Kirk, for the previous year Charles I (1600-1649) had introduced the Book of Common Prayer to Scotland. This struggle, for the General Assembly and Scottish Parliament to determine the Kirk's doctrine, and not the monarch, was to last for fifty years, before Presbyterianism was re-established as the governing theology of Scotland's Kirk. In writing about the Hay Fleming Reference Library as it was in 1974 Rodden remarked that where Covenanting times and Scottish history of the seventeenth century were concerned, Hay Fleming's collections were unparalleled outside the National Library of Scotland.[19] At the time of Hay Fleming's death his library contained over 70 works dealing with the Covenanters, including James King Hewison's two-volume *The Covenanters* (1908), and two editions of Alexander Smellie's *Men of the Covenant* (1903 and 1909), the latter being a gift from the author. There were also 11 copies of the Westminster *Confession of Faith*, a reformed confession of faith drawn up at the Westminster Assembly of 1646, and which became the subordinate standard of doctrine in the Church of Scotland (Hay Fleming also owned 10 copies of the Scottish *Confession of Faith*). His library also contained some further 135 works on Scottish history of the seventeenth century, in addition to some 770 books and 401 pamphlets published in the seventeenth-century. Manuscript material is also to be found, including a covenanter's notebook containing the substance of sermons preached by Guthrie, Cameron, and Renwick during the killing time (1671-1688), and two seventeenth-century volumes of sermons given to him by the businessman James D. Ogilvie (1866-1949), who had

a great interest in the seventeenth century, and was in his spare time book collector, historian, and bibliographer.[20]

Hay Fleming was a staunch Protestant, and had 'the inherent conviction that Scottish Protestantism stood for the highest standard of purity in the doctrine, worship and government of the Christian Church'.[21] It is therefore no great surprise that he took such an interest in the times and events which helped to shape Protestantism in Scotland. Yet his interest in Scottish and religious history went beyond the periods of the Reformation and Covenanters, his library containing outwith these periods over 380 books concerned with Scottish history, as well as over 60 printed sources and documents relating to the history of Scotland, such as Lord High Treasurer's Accounts and State Papers, whilst there are over 1,850 items concerning Christian religious history.

A considerable portion of Hay Fleming's library was focused upon Scottish and religious history of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Like William Blades (1824-90), whose library was composed of books and pamphlets on printing and its history, Francis Fry (1803-86), who specialised in English Bibles, or John Couch Adams (1819-92), who owned 1,500 early books on astronomy, Scottish and religious history was not a topic in vogue in the second half of the nineteenth century.[22] One could therefore argue that Hay Fleming belonged to the group of collectors who, at this time, built significant subject-focused libraries outwith the fashionable circuits of fine and early printing, literary classics, and illuminated manuscripts.

Aside from his interest in the Reformation and Covenanting times Hay Fleming also had a passion for local history, his library containing some 180 volumes relating to St Andrews, and a further 59 to Fife. This interest led him to the task of transcribing the documents in St Andrews' town archive:

> I think I told you before [he wrote to Craigie in 1903] that a good deal of my spare time has been devoted this last year to the books & documents in the Town's-safe. I am anxious to have them put in better order & with that end in view have sent a few papers to the St Andrews Citizen, hoping in this way to excite some local interest in the old records.[23]

Some years before this Sir James Donaldson (1831-1915), Principal of the United College of St Salvator and St Leonard at the University of St Andrews 1886-1915, spoke to Hay Fleming about starting a society for the publication of local records, possibly thinking of those held both by the town and University, but Hay Fleming feared that 'the difficulties in the way are insuperable'.[24] Whether Hay Fleming gave serious thought to this proposal is unknown, but certainly no such society was begun.

Hay Fleming's interest in original (Scottish) documents was not a new phenomenon, but was certainly somewhat out of fashion by the late-nineteenth/early-twentieth century. In the first half of the nineteenth century there had been a flutter in the founding of clubs interested in the preservation and printing of original documents relating to Scottish history – for there was a notion amongst men of learning that the rapid industrialisation and urbanisation of Scotland at this time meant its historic nationhood was under threat. This was to be countered by delving in to Scotland's literary heritage, as a means of enhancing Scotland's distinctiveness.[25] Thus we find the founding of the Bannatyne Club in 1823, the Maitland Club in 1828, the Iona Club in 1833 (a short-lived club which only produced one volume), the Abbotsford Club in 1834, and the Spalding Club in 1839. Sir Walter Scott's (1771-1832) passion for publishing 'works

illustrative of the history, literature, and antiquities of Scotland', which had influenced so many historians in the early nineteenth century, was not long to outlive his death.[26] By the mid 1860s each of these Clubs had ceased to exist. No longer was an interest in Scottish history the mark of a broadly educated Scotsman; instead, this had come to be seen as the mark of a narrow parochialism which most Scots wished to abandon.[27] Yet for Hay Fleming, the study of Scottish history was to be his life's work.

Over the course of his life Hay Fleming produced some 250 works as either author or editor/collaborator.[28] His larger works include *The Alphabetic Guide Book to St Andrews* (St Andrews, 1881), which was repeatedly revised and enlarged, still being in publication long after his death; the *Guide to the East Neuk of Fife* (Cupar, 1886); and *St Andrews Cathedral Museum* (Edinburgh and London, 1931), his final work before his death. He also undertook editorial work at Register House in Edinburgh, being invited in 1910 to undertake volume two of the *Register of the Privy Seal of Scotland* (which was not published until 1921). The principal work with which Hay Fleming's name is associated, however, is *Mary, Queen of Scots* (London, 1897). Although he promised in the preface of this work a second volume, which would deal with Mary's life in England, this work was never completed; a volume on John Knox, and a history of St Andrews, likewise never materialised.[29]

Hay Fleming's output of shorter pamphlets and articles far outweigh his larger publications, and it is amongst these that publications on John Knox are to be found, including 'The last days of John Knox' (1913) and 'Was John Knox a Royal Chaplain?' (1924). It is also amongst these shorter publications that we find many works on St Andrews, including 'Historical notes and extracts concerning the links of St Andrews, 1552-1893' (1893), 'Four old documents concerning the town church of St Andrews' (1903), and 'Local archaeological objects in St Andrews Museum: with notes' (1909). Many critical reviews also came from Hay Fleming's pen, which were often harsh (but fair), and with a satirical style; being incensed by an article which appeared in the *Builder* on 17th April 1886, he wrote a letter to the editor, saying of the author, R.B. Preston, that 'a worthy successor has at length been found for Baron Munchhausen'.[30] Although his own writings could be 'weighty', this was a fact of which he was aware, and it is with humour that upon the cessation of a periodical he wrote to a friend that perhaps it was just as well that his article was no longer needed, 'for people might have said that my hearty article had sunk the craft!'.[31]

It was not only through his writings that he promoted the study of Scottish history; Hay Fleming was also actively involved with a number of societies. In October 1905 he became Secretary of the Scottish History Society, but retired three years later when he could no longer devote the time needed to fulfil his duties.[32] In 1916 he was elected Vice-President of the Scottish Reformation Society, being elected as its President in 1919, a post which he held until his death; by this time he had devoted nearly forty years to the Society through holding office as a member of Committee.[33] Hay Fleming was also involved with the Knox Club, whose publications aimed to: promote the study of Scottish history, in particular the period of John Knox; maintain and safeguard the Protestant succession to the throne; and resist the efforts of the Roman Catholic Church in regaining influence in Scotland.[34] It was a short-lived society, passing out of existence before 1931. Elected as its Vice-President, Hay Fleming missed the inaugural meeting on 24 November 1909 due to being confined at home with a chill.[35] Plagued throughout his life by ill-health, from 1925 onwards it seriously affected his work. Following a course of treatment for an ulcer on his eye in February of that year he was forced to cease his work at Register House, and after suffering an attack of shingles in July 1927 he spent the remainder of his life plagued by acute neuritis in the back of the head, neck, and right

shoulder.[36] Undoubtedly the ulcer on his eye must have affected his ability to read (yet he had long suffered with eye trouble, telling Craigie in 1902 that working on the Heroic Poem on Darnley had been 'very sore on my eyes', and admitting to Andrew Lang (1844-1912) in 1912 that his eyes 'have been mainly hurt by working on old papers (charters, &c.) by gas light'),[37]and although he could no longer work at Register House he continued with his own research, continuing to publish works after 1925. Hay Fleming also continued to answer enquiries from correspondents despite his ill health, a service which did not go unacknowledged. Aware of the acute pain from which Hay Fleming was suffering at the beginning of 1928, the town clerk J. Cargill Cantley did not expect Hay Fleming to reply to his enquiry about the ownership of the steeple of St Andrews' Parish Church, and was unreserved in his gratitude after Hay Fleming did look into the matter:

> I am extremely obliged to you for the information which you have given me as to the entries in the Heritors Books. That information will be very useful, and I can only repeat that I am exceedingly grateful to you for taking so much trouble in the present state of your health.[38]

As a self-taught historian, Hay Fleming's abilities were clearly well regarded, certainly within his local community. In 1898 he received an honorary LL.D from the University of St Andrews, in recognition of his labours as a scholar and the work he had done for the town of St Andrews,[39] and three years later, in 1901, when the Fraser Chair was created at the University of Edinburgh in 1901, Hay Fleming was encouraged by [Prof.?] Lang to apply for the position; but Hay Fleming recognised his own short-comings in the Latin and French tongue, in addition to his lack of teaching experience, and acknowledged that the Court was unlikely to 'make any man a professor who had never taken a University course'.[40] Yet it is clear that he was also regarded with respect by his contemporaries. Such was his renown in the field of Scottish ecclesiastical history that Dr Benjamin Warfield (1851-1921), President of Princeton Theological Seminary, twice invited Hay Fleming to give a series of addresses at the Stone Lectures, the first being in 1907, the second in 1914.[41] Upon taking over editorship of the third volume of *The Register of the Privy Seal of Scotland*, James Beveridge noted that Hay Fleming's death had 'deprived Scottish historical scholarship of a painstaking student [...] and left a vacancy in the circle of research scholars which it will be difficult adequately to fill'.[42]

Hay Fleming's passion for Scottish history cannot be denied, and upon the death of John Scott in 1903, he commented to the English scholar and educational administrator William Symington McCormick (1859-1930) about Scott's rare collection:[43]

> I do not know any library, whether public or private, which contains so many rare books bearing on the history of Scotland. It will be nothing less than a national calamity if they are allowed to go to the hammer, as David Laing's did, to be scattered to all the ends of the earth. An other opportunity of acquiring such a collection may not occur again this century. Many of the printed books are unique, & may never turn up again. Some of his MSS. are of great interest & of abiding value.[44]

It is quite possible that it was from a desire not to see his own library disseminated after his death that Hay Fleming left it to the town of St Andrews.

With his interest in original historical documents it is not surprising that Hay Fleming had a sizeable collection of antiquarian books in his library, owning some 2,067 volumes published

before 1800:[45] one incunabulum, Platina's *Vitae Pontificum* (Treviso, 1485),[46] 92 sixteenth-century books, 770 seventeenth-century books, and 1,204 eighteenth-century books. These include two Latin editions (1554 and 1612) of the Reformer Jean Calvin's (1509-1564) seminal work *Institutio Christianae Religionis*, which was first published in 1536, and was the progenitor of all subsequent Presbyterian doctrinal treatises, as well as the 1575 edition of Hector Boece's (1465?-1536) *Scotorum Historiae a Prima Gentis Origine*, first published in 1526, and the second scholarly history of the Scots to be written.[47]

Hay Fleming's first antiquarian purchases were made in 1868, but serious collecting of antiquarian works began in 1879, when 34 volumes were purchased. The vast majority, however, were acquired between 1911 and 1925. Some bear his annotations, such as David Dalrymple's *Memorials and Letters Relating to the History of Britain in the Reign of James the First* (Glasgow, 1766), where many of the letters listed in the contents have been given a date, and reference to other works are supplied in the margins of the text.[48] Likewise, John Michael Wright's *An Account of His Excellence Roger Earl of Castlemaine's Embassy, from his Sacred Majesty James the IId. ... to his Holiness Innocent XI* (London, 1688) was certainly read, containing annotations to the text, as well as historical context on the verso of the front free endpaper taken from Lord Acton's *Lectures on Modern History* (London, 1906).[49] This evidence of having been read suggests that many of Hay Fleming's antiquarian books were probably acquired for their content, not their 'rarity', and were very much part of his working library.

Hay Fleming's motivation for acquiring books

After the turn of the nineteenth century there was a shift in the way in which people collected books, with a move towards the acknowledgement of books for their rarity, rather than for their use. Yet this would appear to be a shift which did not influence Hay Fleming. As shown above, he certainly had a large number of early-printed books, but the evidence suggests that his interest lay in them for what they revealed about the history of Scotland, in how they could be used to better gain an understanding of the past. In the draft letter to McCormick regarding the sale of Scott's library Hay Fleming ended: 'Wouldn't it bring special glory to Dunfermline & to Fife, if such a library could be secured for the town of Queen Margaret? And if it were secured it might [...] be the nest egg of an unrivalled Scottish Library'.[50] These are the words of a collector who wants these rare books to be used, not to be viewed as trophy items (although Hay Fleming would certainly have viewed the library as a whole in the light of a 'trophy' for Dunfermline).

The over-riding indication is that Hay Fleming was very much influenced by use; that he wanted books which could help with his research interests in Scottish and religious history. Indeed, he recorded as much in one of his notebooks, noting the expenditure of £26 1s 5d, 'Paid for books specially bought, between 23 Nov. 1893 and 30th March 1895, for my Bookman articles on Queen Mary'.[51] Similarly, he acquired many John Knox volumes in 1904 and 1905, which may represent deliberate acquisition for research purposes, for in 1905 he produced his article 'The Life and Work of Knox' from an address delivered at a meeting of the United Original Secession Synod, whilst reviews of works on John Knox by Lennox, MacMillan, Lang, and Cowan appeared in the *British Weekly* and the *Bookman* that same year.

Whilst Hay Fleming had an interest in purchasing works as an aid to research, he also collected books related to his other interests. Thus works on golf were acquired from the 1880s up until the 1930s, whilst works about architecture were collected from the 1880s to the 1920s. Yet sometimes the lines may be blurred between books being acquired for research and those

simply which Hay Fleming enjoyed out of interest. Writing to Craigie in 1895 Hay Fleming noted that 'The Hind let loose is a great favourite of mine. So much so that if you do not care to keep the 1797 ed. I shall be very glad to have it, although I have already the 1687 & 1770 editions'.[52] This was very clearly a favourite book, perhaps due to Hay Fleming's own strong Presbyterian beliefs, yet with his interest in the Covenanters these editions would also have been relevant to his research. Indeed, both his 1687 and 1770 editions have non-alphabetical indices written on the back pastedowns, whilst the former is also heavily underlined, evidence indicative of these early-printed works definitely having been read.[53]

Another dual interest can be seen in some of Hay Fleming's antiquarian books, for amongst these are two works which bear the signature of Andrew Melville (1545-1622), a Scottish scholar, theologian and religious reformer: Julius Caesar Scaliga's *Poemata* (1574) and George Thomson's *Vindex Veritatis* (1606).[54] This may represent an interest in acquiring books previously owned by those involved with religious reform, but Hay Fleming may also have been interested in them due to Melville's connections with St Andrews, for he was both a student at the University, and later Principal of St Mary's College. The latter volume may also have been of interest because of its author, for George Thomson was a Catholic controversialist. Likewise, there are several first editions of works by Samuel Rutherford (c. 1600-1661), a Church of Scotland minister, political theorist, and Covenanter leader, including two copies of his *Lex Rex: the Law and the Prince* (London, 1644), a lengthy (and sometimes bitter) defence of armed resistance to Charles I, copies of which were burned in Edinburgh and St Andrews in 1660 after the restoration of Charles II.[55] These works are a direct link to the past, evidence of religious reform in progress, and very much part of Scotland's history. Their content would have been of great interest to Hay Fleming, but Rutherford, like Melville, was Principal of St Mary's College, and his works could similarly have appealed to Hay Fleming for their local connection. Local connection was certainly a motivational factor which influenced Hay Fleming. In 1895 he revealed to Craigie that two volumes of Duncan's mathematical works, both in perfect condition, and both presentation copies, were bought 'simply because of their St Andrews connection – other-wise they are of no earthly interest to me'.[56]

Of course, sometimes an owner had no say in which books came into his library, these being gifted by friends, family, and others (although one could presumably go down the route of disposing of the book if it really was not to taste or of sentimental value). Thus in Hay Fleming's library we find books given in recognition of scholarly achievement at Madras College, gifts from family members and friends, and gifts from authors. Thus George Lorimer, author of *The Early Days of St. Cuthbert's Church* (Edinburgh, 1915), requested the publishers to send a copy to Hay Fleming because he had freely drawn upon the Register of the Kirk Session of St Andrews which Hay Fleming had edited, and thus sent the book 'In grateful recognition of the benefit which I have received in this way'.[57] Andrew Lang's *St Andrews* (London, 1893) did not contain so flattering an inscription, Lang writing 'with the best wishes of the blundering and Malignant author'.[58] Given before Hay Fleming's review, which appeared in the *Bookman* in February 1894, this may have been anticipating the critical review Hay Fleming was sure to give, but the tone should be taken as one that is bantering, not one which is resentful. Alexander Cameron described Hay Fleming and Lang's friendship 'as remarkable as that between a dog and a cat' due to their being 'at opposite poles of thought with respect to their conception and interpretation of the chief events of history'.[59] Yet remain friends they did, Hay Fleming noting in the preface to one of his works that he and Lang 'were friends as well as antagonists', and that their friendship of over twenty years was 'never strained and never broken'.[60]

Hay Fleming's interaction with his books

Hay Fleming's library was far from being a trophy collection, to be hoarded and added to, but never consulted. On the contrary, he interacted with his books on a number of different levels. As already indicated, Hay Fleming used his library for his own research. It is certainly clear that he revisited works, some books being marked in different inks, and some in ink and pencil, such as W.M. Brady's *The Episcopal Succession in England, Scotland and Ireland A.D. 1408 to 1875* (Rome, 1876-77).[61] Unfortunately such marks give no indication as to whether these were different consultations for the same research, or for different projects.

Hay Fleming was not only an historian, but also a critic. By studying the annotations in Andrew Lang's *St Andrews* (London, 1893) as a case study, some insight into how Hay Fleming worked as a critic may be gained, for a review of this work appeared in the *Bookman* in February 1894. The first three chapters are peppered in the margin with notes of the sources which Lang had used, namely 'Celtic Scotland' (W.F. Skene's *Celtic Scotland*) and 'Lyon' (C.J. Lyon's *History of St Andrews*) – Lang admitted to using both works, and it is clear that Hay Fleming, very familiar with these texts, wanted to verify for himself just how much Lang relied on these authors, enabling him to note that Lang 'frequently quotes them without making special acknowledgment'.[62] A quotation on p. 33 from Wyntoun's *The Orygynale Cronykil of Scotland* regarding the donation of the Boar's Chase has in the margin 'Lyon. i. 62. Compare Wynton ii. 175, 176'. Sharp-eyed Hay Fleming noted that Lang had followed Lyon's spelling, not that found in Wyntoun, and he therefore queried whether Lang had indeed used the original. In addition to these comparisons of sources, Hay Fleming noted inconsistencies within the text by giving a page number in the margin; thus on p. 76 where Lang noted that Paul Craw was burned at St Andrews in 1432 (a date which Hay Fleming corrected to 1433), 'p. 104' is written in the margin, on which page Lang gave the date of martyrdom as 1471.[63] Such cross-referencing is also used to denote where names or topics occur elsewhere within the text. Not all of Hay Fleming's annotations in *St Andrews* took the form of the written word, with some being lines, question marks, crosses, and ticks, a simple marking method which was a common way of showing agreement or disagreement with textual argument, and was employed by the likes of the politician W.E. Gladstone (1809-1898), the statesman and author George Otto Trevelyan (1838-1928), and the novelist Anthony Trollope (1815-1882).[64] In *St Andrews* large crosses mark passages worthy of comment, lines other passages over which comment can be made. Typographical and factual errors are also corrected, and Lang is forgiven for neither.

When consulting a book for research, rather than criticism, Hay Fleming's approach to reading a text did not differ. The correcting of both factual and typographical errors is a common feature of his annotations, as is the marking of passages by a vertical line. He made cross-references to related topics within a book, and referenced secondary sources; at the end of an entry on William Chisholm in Dowden's *The Bishops of Scotland* Hay Fleming wrote at the bottom of the page: 'For a paper on The Character and Career of William Chisholm II. By the Rev. Dr. Ritchie of Dunblane, see Transactions of the Scottish Ecclesiological Society, vol. vii. part iii. pp. 45-54'.[65] He also referenced edited editions of sources to either confirm or query statements, as in A.F. Mitchell's *The Scottish Reformation* (Edinburgh, 1900), where next to a passage which reads '[Wishart] dispensed the communion in both kinds at Dun' he noted that although Petrie stated this, Knox, Calderwood, and Spottiswood did not.[66] References to other works dealing with the same topic would also be made. Such referencing indicates that Hay Fleming not only wanted to be familiar with the facts contained in a single work, but also how events were reported in a variety of sources. He wanted to know if and how authorities differed. Although the majority of his references are to printed sources, he also referenced original

manuscripts. In Dowden's *The Bishops of Scotland* next to text which reads 'Scheves is said to have died 28 Jan. 1496-7' Hay Fleming has written '*' in the margin, noting at the bottom of the page 'Anno Domini 1496 obiit Wilelmus Scheuez (Law's MS.)'.[67] Hay Fleming was not content to accept the words of other historians; he needed to find out the facts for himself. His practice as a reader thus transferred well to his professional practice as an historian; as Paton noted, Hay Fleming's historical works were 'characterised by the painstaking examination and elucidation of facts gathered often from a multitude of obscure sources'.[68]

As these annotations show, Hay Fleming could not brook sloppiness in a work, both typographically and factually. It is clear that when reading a work critical observations were commonly made. These were usually small comments in the margin, but in George Lorimer's *The Early Days of St Cuthbert's Church, Edinburgh* (Edinburgh and London, 1915), a printed extract from the St Cuthbert records on pp. 94-95 has been heavily corrected by Hay Fleming in red ink, with a note in black ink on p. 95 to 'See fly-leaf at the end of this work', where he has copied the entry as it should be.[69] The numerous errors clearly irked him. Additionally, he gave a note about the authenticity of the entry in the manuscript, writing:

> The latest entry in the vol. is on fol. 257 recto and is dated 31 Dec. 1629. The verso is blank. Then follows the folio (numbered 176) on which the above entry is written. It is on the same kind of paper, but appears to have been pasted in. In the minute of 12th November 1629 (folio 255 verso) there is no reference to this meeting of the great session.

His critical observations are thus not confined to the text, but include the physical object, where such information may affect the reading of the text. Indeed, other annotations give supplementary information about the text. In his own work *Some Subscribed Copies of the Solemn League and Covenant* (Edinburgh, 1918) the text mentions other English Commissioners who signed the Bodleian Library's copy of the Covenant on 22nd December 1643. Amongst these men was Thomas Hatcher. Hay Fleming marked an 'x' next to this, noting in the bottom margin 'Hatcher and Nye had sailed for England (with Henderson, Maitland, G. Gillespie, and Meldrum) on the 30th of August (Laing's Baillie's Letters, ii. 98, 99; Hope's Diary, p. 195)', thus providing some context of how Hatcher came to be in England at this time.[70] Similarly, provenance information is provided in the margin about the copiously signed copy in the University Library of St Andrews: 'The Rev. James M'Bean, Librarian of the University Library, in a letter of 3rd. March 1875, addressed to Miss Mary Webster, explained that this copy was bought at the sale of Principal Lee's Library'.[71] Such annotations could provide useful contextualisation of the text.

Hay Fleming's interaction with his books was not confined to reading. He would add missing text in order to make a work complete where pages were missing. For example, a copy of John Welsh's *Forty-Eight Sermons*, purchased on 17th September 1872, has no title page and some pages are torn with text missing.[72] These pages have been repaired, upon which Hay Fleming has written the missing text – although whether he waited until he purchased a second copy in 1920, or used a copy from elsewhere to fill in the gaps, is unclear. His purpose for completing the text is likewise unclear; on the one hand it could represent someone who wanted the work to be complete (but who was not going to the lengths of making up a copy from two imperfect copies), yet on the other hand it could have been a desire to have at his finger-tips the entire text of the *Sermons*, without the need of consulting a copy elsewhere.

Other books included the addition of an index or contents in order to make a work easier to reference, and facilitate future use. In his copy of George Martine's *Reliquiae divi Andreae* (St Andrews, 1797) a two-page index (non-alphabetical) has been written and pasted in at the back; people and landmarks form the main, but there is the occasional reference to textual content.[73] Hay Fleming would also add contents lists to volumes, primarily in works bound together, but also to monographs, such as his copy of J.F.S. Gordon's *Ecclesiastical Chronicle for Scotland* (London, 1875).[74] In his copy of John Knox's *The Historie of the Reformatioun of Religioun within the Realm of Scotland* (Edinburgh, 1732) he not only listed the contents of this volume, but also that of the 1897 edition, and the copy found in St Andrews University Library.[75] This would presumably help to distinguish the differences between the editions without having to constantly compare all three volumes.

Some interactions with his books were intended to make his own personal observations clear. In Mitchell's *The Scottish Reformation* next to a quotation from Revelation xiv.II Hay Fleming has marked an 'x', writing at the bottom of the page: 'After the last proof had left my hands, the printers, without acquainting me, altered this quotation, making it agree exactly with the authorised version, and also put it within inverted commas. See infra, p. 307. D.H.F.'.[76] Such alterations to his proofs were not a one-off occurrence. In telling Craigie about his edition of Patrick Walker's *Six Saints of the Covenant* he wrote:

> Patrick Walker was, I fondly hoped, fairly off my hands some time ago. But the printers have only recently begun to throw off. Last week they sent me the sheets of nearly the whole of the first volume. Judge of my righteous indignation on discovering that, after I had returned the final proofs, the proof-reader had gone over them again and corrected what he thought were obvious misprints! He made all the alterations without consulting me. He has tampered with proper names, place-names, and other words as well. This is very mortifying after all the pains I took to give a faithful text. I checked the proof with Patrick's own editions, line by line and word by word; and all in vain! I am now insisting on the printers putting in a note, stating explicitly that the proof-reader made unauthorised alterations, and giving a list of the alterations he did make.[77]

Hay Fleming clearly took pride in being accurate, and would be appalled to think that anyone would assume such errors were his own. In making his own views clear, he was also protecting his professional reputation.

Such annotations as these raise the question of whether they were for Hay Fleming's own benefit, or for that of borrowers. Certainly when he sent an offprint of his article 'Lord Guthrie and the Covenanters' to J.A. Fairley, to which was appended a printed response by Lord Guthrie, the inscription 'This evasive and cuttlefish note will be answered', written at the end, was clearly intended for Fairley.[78] Yet Hay Fleming does not overtly address readers in his annotations in his books. The impression given is that they are there to enhance the text, whether the reader is himself or someone else. Although Hay Fleming may not have had in mind future readers of his books when annotating them, as did George Otto Trevelyan, William Blake (1752-1827), or Thomas Connary (1814-1899) (an Irish-American farmer who deliberately addressed his family in his books), they were clearly appreciated by those who had access to them, the Rev. James King Hewison (1853-1941) noting in 1926: 'When I see the care with which you read and annotate such works, I regret that I did not sooner throw myself upon your generosity and get into your treasure-house sooner and longer'.[79] King Hewison was an eminent researcher and writer on Scottish seventeenth-century ecclesiastical history, and

with its strengths in this area, it is no wonder that he referred to Hay Fleming's library as a 'treasure house'; no doubt many of Hay Fleming's volumes, whether annotated or not, would have been relevant to his research.

Although he annotated his books, it is clear that Hay Fleming did not view them as scrap paper for any scribblings, where every blank space should be used; there is always a clear connection between his marginalia and the book, and longer annotations tended to be confined to blank leaves. Volumes N.S. 8-9 of the *Original Secession Magazine* bear copious annotations on their flyleaves, containing an account of a Secession Congregation at St Andrews and its minister, which continues from vol. 8 into vol. 9. Whilst the flyleaves hold as much text as they can contain, the margins of the printed pages themselves are relatively free of annotations.[80] Unlike the Rev. Adam Sedgwick (1785-1873), Woodwardian Professor of Geology, vice-master of Trinity College, and canon of Norwich Cathedral, who scribbled on any available space in the margins of his books, Hay Fleming mostly confined himself to the blank flyleaves at the front and back for his lengthier annotations.[81] Perhaps he felt that cluttered margins interfered with the readability of the text.

Hay Fleming also interacted with his books on a physical level, by using them as a repository for letters and related ephemera. Westphall notes that in some instances a book was enhanced with ephemera 'simply because it offers space to do so, and because it is likely to survive'.[82] Yet in Hay Fleming's case the evidence suggests that there was always a connection between the item inserted and the book. Thus many of the letters pasted into his books are there because they are from the author. In the case of Smellie's *Men of the Covenant* (1909) the book was sent along with the letter, but sometimes letters were received before he purchased the book. In February 1913 J.C. Carrick sent a letter to Hay Fleming, in which he mentioned the original copy of the Covenants at Newbattle, signed by Lothian and Leighton: 'I have given an account of it in my large vol – "The Abbey of S. Mary; Newbottle"'.[83] It is possible that this letter inspired Hay Fleming to purchase the book one year later.

Other ephemera inserted by Hay Fleming provided additional information to the printed text of the book. In 1927 Madame Pauline Ferguson sent a copy of a memorial inscription to Robert Reid in St Jacques Church, Dieppe, to Hay Fleming, which he inserted in *The Bishops of Scotland* at the relevant entry.[84] In the same volume were placed a letter about Ingeram de Kethenys by J. Maitland Thomson and part of a letter from Miss Dowden on Bishop James Atkins at the relevant entries.[85] Hay Fleming's copy of Martine's *Reliquiae divi Andreae* has tipped onto the back free endpaper a manuscript dated 'At St Andrews the 17th day of August 1696', a manuscript which shed some light upon the author.[86] Similarly, his copy of Carrick's *The Abbey of S. Mary Newbottle* has an obituary to the author pasted on the front pastedown, whilst the cuttings pasted into W.W. Tulloch's *The Life of Tom Morris* (London, 1908) not only include an obituary of the author from *The Scotsman*, 22 January 1920, but also a cutting from *Golf Illustrated*, 8 December 1899, showing a trick camera shot of Tom Morris standing on water playing golf.[87] Whatever ephemera was placed in a book, whether a letter from the author, or evidence shedding further light on the text, there was always some connection between item and book. Material was not placed there simply because there was space to do so.

Hay Fleming's library as used by others

Hay Fleming did not keep his library to himself. Just as Walter Arthur Copinger (1847-1910), who taught law first in Owens College, Manchester, then at Victoria University, Manchester, readily placed his knowledge and his library as the disposal of any student, so too did Hay

Fleming allow access to his library.[88] After Hay Fleming's death Alexander Cameron recalled how he 'had full use' of this 'valuable collection'.[89] Whilst Hay Fleming was willing for others to come and physically use his library, for those too far away to visit he would willingly search his books for answers to enquiries. Craigie, who was a co-editor of the *New English Dictionary* until 1933, often asked for Hay Fleming's assistance in looking up the origins of words. For example, in 1901 when Craigie asked about the words Kingsmen and Queensmen, Hay Fleming, who was in Edinburgh at the time, answered 'I have not been able yet to come across the Kingsmen and Queensmen, although I have looked over almost every likely book that we have with us'.[90] It was one year later when he finally came across a reference, in Spottiswoode's *History*, indicating that he did not cease searching for answers.[91] Strangers, as well as friends, benefitted from his help, Ogilvie writing in September 1914, 'Now I thank you again for all your kindness to an unknown correspondent'.[92] It was not just his own books to which he would turn for answers, but also those held in other libraries; for instance, in 1908 he advised Craigie that 'I hope one of these days to go down to the Public Library and hunt for the word you want in the Maitland Club vol.'.[93] Although his library was well-stocked, there were obviously gaps which could be supplied from elsewhere, and Edinburgh in the early-twentieth century was well placed to provide such aid: the public library had opened in 1890, thanks to philanthropic funding from Andrew Carnegie (1835-1919); libraries for medical and legal professions flourished in Scotland, Edinburgh being home to the Advocates Library, which served as the national deposit library of Scotland, becoming the basis of the National Library in 1925; and access was freely granted to university libraries, which had long been rooted in the local community, one such library being that of New College. Hay Fleming made full use of all of these resources – although the 'Edinburgh libraries' did not always have what he wanted, as he twice informed Craigie.[94]

In addition to undertaking research for correspondents, whether from his own books or the resources of local libraries, Hay Fleming also freely lent his books to others – although Paton noted that there were some books which he possessed for research 'which he would not willingly let pass into the hands of others'.[95] Paton fails to elaborate as to why Hay Fleming was so unwilling to lend some books. One possible explanation is that some of these research books may have contained manuscript notes which Hay Fleming was unwilling for others to read lest his ideas be stolen before publication. Another possible explanation is that he may have deemed their content unsuitable for some eyes, for he would doctor some works before lending them, on one occasion cutting the realistic woodcuts from a volume on the Waldensian massacres, 'lest the curious investigator of later times should be contaminated'.[96]

Hay Fleming kept a list of books which he lent, dating from January 1883 to July 1909, which records detailed information, including the date the item was lent, the recipient, their address (not given for every entry), the item lent, and the return date.[97] It is a document which would benefit from further study, for it will undoubtedly shed much light on the lending and borrowing habits of readers in late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Scotland. Yet, for our present purposes, this list of books reveals much about the usage of Hay Fleming's library by others than himself.

Like the eighteenth-century baronet of Cartsburn, Thomas Crawford, Hay Fleming lent his books to a variety of people, including professors, reverends, librarians, architects, watchmakers, clothiers, solicitors, students, and gardeners.[98] It seems that no-one was denied access to his library. It was not only books which he lent, but also journals, magazines, and manuscripts, with no regard for the age of the item. Thus in January 1883 Hay Fleming lent to Prof. Peter Redford Scott Lang (1850-1926), Regius Professor of Mathematics in the

University of St Andrews 1879-1921, a manuscript volume of Mathematics by John Geddy dated 1585, whilst in September and October 1884 the Rev. Mr Somerville borrowed two books dating to 1671 and 1694 respectively.[99] Hay Fleming was not the only one to lend rare items. In a letter dated 12th May 1891 Charles Greig McCrie (1836-1910) told Hay Fleming that their friend Mr Gibb had 'very kindly looked up his copy of the earliest printed edition of Knox's History, & found the reference was actually to p. 218 of that rare book. He has followed up his friendly help by giving me the use of the volume for any length of time'.[100] The lending of valuable items did not go unnoticed by recipients. William Thomson, in June 1909, wrote 'I quite appreciate the value you put on the only remaining copy of your work', when borrowing *The Hammermen of St Andrews*.[101]

Hay Fleming was accommodating when items were required – if an item was needed urgently he would offer to post it immediately. In May 1899 he wrote to Craigie that he had Henderson's *Vernacular Literature*, and that Craigie was

> heartily welcome to the use of it any time – either now or later on. If you would like it at once, drop a post card saying so, and it will be sent on to you without delay. Otherwise I will take it to Edinburgh with us, & you can get it when you come.[102]

Hay Fleming's notebook shows that the book was lent on 6th June 1899, indicating that Craigie was happy to wait.[103]

Most items were lent for a period of days, weeks, or months, with some being on loan for over one year. William Thomson, who borrowed *The Hammermen of St Andrews*, promised on 23rd June 1909 that 'It shall be returned not later than 2 or 3 days hence'.[104] Clearly some borrowers felt guilt over the period they retained a work. In January 1904 J.J. Smith borrowed the Minutes of the Praying Society of Cameron, writing in December 1905 'I am returning the minute book of the Praying Society which you kindly lent me (I am ashamed to say how long ago) by parcel post, and trust it will reach you safely'.[105] Some items, however, were on loan for a significantly longer period. On 1st February 1894 the Rev. Mr Sloan borrowed the *Original Secession Magazine*, vol. xiv, not returning it until 3rd April 1905, some 11 years later.[106] Sometimes requests were made for extending a loan. In July 1921 Thomas Miller had on loan six books and one pamphlet, which he appears to have used for his article 'The Parochial Law of Tithes'. He now wished 'to attempt to treat the [...] subject of Tithe Law down to date by a subsidiary article or two and to publish the whole revised', and it is presumably for this purpose that he asked Hay Fleming 'if you can spare them longer, I beg the favor [*sic*] of a further period of loan and I know the value of what I am asking'.[107]

One risk of lending books was the danger of them not being returned – although the father of Elizabeth Grant of Rothiemurchus (1797-1885) believed 'that any loss or damage [...] was to be balanced against the amount of good distributed".[108] In thanking Hay Fleming for the loan of a book in January 1905 H.S.C. Everard (1848-1909) wrote 'It will be absolutely safe with me, and I'm most particular in safeguarding and returning books lent to me, as I have suffered so much myself from other people failing to do likewise'.[109] Hay Fleming, too, suffered from the non-return of books. On 9th January 1883 he lent to the Rev. George Rose of Aberdeen *The Braemar Highlands* by Elizabeth Taylor, whilst on 4th May 1901 lending to Mr John Cochrane, of Synod Hall, a manuscript of Edinburgh Accounts 1718-1720. Neither has a return date in his notebook.[110] Whilst the former item was replaceable, the loss of the latter must have been somewhat galling for Hay Fleming.[111] It cannot be known whether this was an original

manuscript, or a handwritten copy, but the loss of the former would be irreplaceable, whilst the latter would mean many more hours recopying the information. Occasionally Hay Fleming himself was guilty of not returning items. When 'redding up' in February 1907 he came across a copy of the American 'Caledonian' for December 1901, which Craigie had sent in February 1902; Craigie had wanted it returned, as it contained a portrait of G.F. Black, and it must have been with humour that Hay Fleming informed Craigie 'After its five years captivity it will be returned to-morrow'.[112]

Just as there was no limit to the types of people to whom Hay Fleming would lend his books, so too was there apparently no limit to where he would send books. Most were sent locally in Scotland: St Andrews, Strathkinness, Cupar, Broughty Ferry, Edinburgh, Dundee. But others were sent further afield, both in Scotland and the UK: Blairgowrie, Aberdeen, Glasgow, Ballachulish, Newcastle upon Tyne, Carlisle, and London all feature in his notebook. Sometimes, though, the physicality of the item posed postage problems. When writing to John Bilson in April 1923 regarding the architecture of St Rule's Tower, Hay Fleming quoted from a book by Russell Walker, informing Bilson that 'If his book was not such a big heavy one, I would send it up to you'.[113] Although it could not be posted, Hay Fleming advised Bilson that when he came to Edinburgh 'I will gladly show you it and everything else in my possession concerning St. Rule's'.[114] In correspondence regarding a translation of David Calderwood's *Altare Damascenum* in August 1903, W. MacLeod noted that his copy was 'rather bulky'; perhaps this was why he suggested that Hay Fleming consult it in the College Library, rather than offering to lend his own.[115]

Whilst some, such as John Bilson, were keen to use Hay Fleming's library for their own research, others may have had different reasons for borrowing books. For Hay Fleming's younger borrowers, it must have been for pleasure, as when Master James Duff borrowed Begg's *Instrumental Music* in March 1887, and when Mr Paterson borrowed a 'Book on Wood Carving' in November 1891 this may have been for practical advice.[116] Similarly, when the architect David Henry (1835-1914) borrowed three guide books concerned with Newcastle and Hexam for three weeks in August 1902, these may have been to take on holiday, or even on business, this area being a popular place for Scottish professionals to work in the nineteenth century.[117] This clearly shows that Hay Fleming wished his library to be used for all manner of purposes, not solely for research.

Conclusion

Hay Fleming's library did not follow the trends of the nineteenth century. In a world where books were valued for their rarity, with some libraries being (on the surface, at least) trophy collections, Hay Fleming made purchases based upon his own research needs and interests as an amateur historian and gentleman scholar. As such, he followed in the footsteps of the likes of Blades, Fry, and Adams, building a significant subject-focused library which sat outwith the fashionable circuits of fine and early printing, literary classics, or illuminated manuscripts. Although many subject-areas can be found within his library, including archaeology, architecture, and golf, Hay Fleming's primary focus was on Scottish and religious history of the Reformation and Covenanting periods – history and religion of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Due to this interest Hay Fleming owned a considerable number of early-printed works, but these were not deemed as trophy items for their rarity; rather, were rather purchased for what they revealed about the past, whether through content or former ownership. Motivated by research to make some purchases, he was also influenced by local connections and personal interests, and sometimes the line is not clear cut as to the reason. But it is clear that he wanted to use his books; his library was not a trophy collection.

As an historian, Hay Fleming was keen to ensure that his facts were right, facts which were verified through original sources. In this way he sought to re-establish the characters of the Reformers and Covenanters – although his own Protestant views fail to ensure an unbiased viewpoint, no matter how correct the historical facts. By the end of the nineteenth century Great Britain was trying to forge a new future – one of unity between England, Scotland, and Wales; the collection of early-printed books written in the vernacular became popular, for they were viewed as forging the bed-rock of this nation of Great Britain. Yet this did not influence Hay Fleming, who remained interested in the history of Scotland – the study of which had seen a revival in the eighteenth century following the Union with England, and which had been promoted by the founding of many clubs, such as the Bannatyne, Maitland, and Spalding clubs in the early nineteenth century. These clubs had aimed to bring to the fore once more original documents, but the study of Scottish history had fallen out of fashion by the latter half of the nineteenth century. By this time it was no longer deemed fashionable, and no longer marked the broadly educated Scotsman. Yet this did not deter Hay Fleming. He was a proud Scotsman, and proud Protestant, and the two together gave him the impetus to follow his passion in Scottish and religious history. To this end his library was very much a working library. He not only consulted his books for his own research and critical reviews, but also in order to answer the multitude of enquiries which arrived by post from both friends and strangers. Whilst reading his books he made annotations; his obsession was to point out factual errors, to give directions to other works which corroborated facts, to insert cuttings or quotations which gave context or additional information to the textual content, or to facilitate future use by the inclusion of a contents list or index. His books also served as a repository for letters and ephemera, but there was no thought of placing material here simply because the books offered space to do so; connections were sought, whether to the author or content.

Scotland had benefitted from a distinct library culture which had been in place for well over 100 years by the mid-nineteenth century, thanks to an independent legal and education system. Literature could be accessed via working-class and middle-class subscription libraries (circulating libraries being less common, primarily being found in the towns of the east coast), whilst access was also granted to university libraries, which had long been rooted in the local community. As such there was no shortage of gaining access to information. Yet it is clear that Hay Fleming's library was sought out by people far and wide, and that it was a working library for others as well as for himself. For those who could not visit themselves, he would happily search his volumes for answers to enquiries, or lend books to those who made such a request. His library was open to all, borrowers being of all ages and backgrounds, from professors and reverends to clothiers and gardeners. Few items were denied, unless weight prohibited postage. Requests ranged from music books to guidebooks, but enquiries also came in for more serious works. For those researchers whose interests coincided with Hay Fleming's, it was possible that his library contained works hard to find in other libraries; but as noted, when lending books, his clientele included people from all social backgrounds, and the books lent were far from always being of a scholarly nature.

Hay Fleming's library was built almost from scratch, with just a few books inherited from family members. Over the course of nearly 70 years he amassed nearly 13,000 volumes, of which a large proportion was concerned with Scottish and religious history of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, including many works published during these periods. The description of him as 'the owner of one of the largest and most valuable private libraries in Scotland' was seemingly apt, and we should consider Hay Fleming to be historian, antiquarian, critic, and book collector.

[1] A Correspondent, 'The late Dr Hay Fleming', *Scotsman*, 9 November 1931, p. 8.
[2] The most complete study to date of Hay Fleming is that by Paton, published three years after Hay Fleming's death, in 1934. It covered many aspects of Hay Fleming's life and interests, including his passion for books, but no serious analysis of Hay Fleming as a book collector was included, H.M. Paton, *David Hay Fleming: Historian and Antiquary* (Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, 1934).
[3] This and subsequent figures for the number of volumes in Hay Fleming's library are taken from the notebooks compiled by the University of St Andrews library staff in 1932 and 1933 when cataloguing the collection, St Andrews University Library (SAUL) MS dep113/38/77-78, MS dep113/39/79-81, MS dep113/39/85-86. These give the most accurate record of Hay Fleming's library at the time of his death, for not only has it subsequently been added to, but in 1977 some items were withdrawn and sold, three such works having come to light in the University of St Andrews Library. See SAUL Typ SwG.B80LBA, Typ BE.C96MH, and r17 BX1779.G7C86, all bearing Hay Fleming's ownership inscription together with a withdrawn stamp.
[4] See, for example, A.N.L. Munby, *Phillips Studies I-V* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1951-1960); M.E. Stanton, 'Harvey Cushing: Book Collector', *Journal of the American Medical Association* 192:2 (1965), 141-144; R. MacDonald (ed.), *The Library of Drummond of Hawthornden* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1971); B. Carroll-Horrocks and G. Steinberg, 'Serge Diaghilev (1872-1929): Passionate Book Collector', *Harvard Library Bulletin* 11:24 (2000), 45-47; E. Potten, '"A great number of Usefull books": The Hidden Library of Henry Booth, 1st Earl of Warrington (1652-1694)', *Library and Information History* 25:1 (2009), 33-49; B. Hillyard, 'Rosebery as Book Collector', *The Journal of the Edinburgh Bibliographical Society* 7 (2012), 71-114.
[5] The estate was that of Hay and Gosman, worth £35,000, of which Hay Fleming and his mother received one third. See Paton, *David Hay Fleming*, pp. 13-15.
[6] Some exceptions are T.R. Harlow, 'Thomas Robbins, Clergyman, Book Collector, and Librarian', *Papers of the Bibliographical Society of America* 61:1 (1967), 1-11; A.F. Westphall, '"Laboring in my Books": A Religious Reader in Nineteenth Century New Hampshire', *The Library* 7th series 13:2 (2012), 185-204; V. Dunstan, 'Professionals, their Private Libraries, and Wider Reading Habits in Late Eighteenth- and Early Nineteenth-Century Scotland', *Library and Information History*, 30:2 (2014), 110-128.
[7] In his forthcoming article Potten not only calls for further research into the wider social and economic demographic of book collector in the nineteenth century in order 'to produce a more holistic and enlightening picture of private book ownership and use', but also advocates a reassessment of the libraries of noble bibliophiles, which may reveal that their interaction with their books may be more nuanced than previously suggested, E. Potten, 'The Rest of the Iceberg: Reassessing Private Book Ownership in the Nineteenth Century', in *Transactions of the Cambridge Bibliographical Society*, vol. 15(ii), (Cambridge: Cambridge University Library, forthcoming). With grateful thanks to Ed Potten for sending a preview of his paper.
[8] SAUL MS 36789.
[9] Edinburgh, National Archives of Scotland SC70/4/666/314, p. 315. It was five years later, on 17th November 1936, that the Hay Fleming Reference Library at Kinburn House was inaugurated, 'Dr Hay Fleming. St Andrews Ceremony', *Scotsman*, 18 November 1936, p. 16. Moved to the St Andrews Branch of Fife County Library in 1962, the Hay Fleming Reference Library was deposited with the University of St Andrews in 2000, with formal ownership being transferred to the University on 1st August 2013.
[10] 'Honouring Dr Hay Fleming', *St Andrews Citizen*, 29 April 1905, p. 5.
[11] This was *The Holy Bible* (Glasgow, 1860), which bears the inscription 'David Hay Fleming 171 South Street St Andrews 9th Jan. 1865', SAUL Hay BS185.E60G5.
[12] Paton, *David Hay Fleming*, p. 22.
[13] SAUL MS dep113/40/109 and MS dep113/40/126.
[14] D.C. Stam, 'Growing up with Books: Fanny Seward's Book Collecting, Reading, and Writing in Mid-Nineteenth-Century New York State', *Libraries and Culture* 41:2 (2006), 196.
[15] Edinburgh, National Library of Scotland (NLS), Dep171/24, letter dated 27 May 1929.
[16] Paton, *David Hay Fleming*, p. 89; SAUL MS dep113/2/6/1-16.
[17] Paton, *David Hay Fleming*, p. 82.
[18] The pamphlets are listed in a notebook entitled 'Chronological List of 16th 17th and 18th Century Pamphlets in my possession', SAUL MS dep113/47. It is dated 8 April 1908, and some slight variations in ink suggest that some entries may have been added at a later date.
[19] A. Rodden, 'The Hay Fleming Reference Library, St Andrews', *SLA News* 122 (1974), 113.
[20] SAUL MS dep113/55, a covenanter's notebook; MS dep113/60/3-4.
[21] Paton, *David Hay Fleming*, p. 107.
[22] D. Pearson. 'Private Libraries and the Collecting Instinct', in A. Black and P. Hoare (ed.), *The Cambridge History of Libraries in Britain and Ireland. Vol. 3, 1850-2000* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006), pp. 186-187.
[23] SAUL MS 36767.

[24] SAUL MS 36743/1
[25] P.R. Murray, 'Antiquarianism', in B. Bell (ed.), *The Edinburgh History of the Book in Scotland. Volume 3 Ambition and Industry 1800-80* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), p. 278. For a reassessment of the strength of Scottish nationalism in the period 1830-1860, and how it demanded equality with England within the Union of 1707, see G. Morton, *Union-Nationalism: Governing Urban Scotland, 1830-1860* (East Linton: Tuckwell Press, 1999).
[26] Ibid., p. 279. For the influence which Scott had on the study of Scottish history see M. Ash, *The Strange Death of Scottish History* (Edinburgh: The Ramsay Head Press, 1980), pp. 21-40.
[27] *Ibid*., p. 10.
[28] Listed in Paton, *David Hay Fleming*, pp. 117-136.
[29] *Ibid*., pp. 80-82.
[30] SAUL MS dep113/2/8/1a-g. The editor responded by informing Hay Fleming that his letter was 'too long and rather too polemical in style', criticising him for being too harsh upon the author, to which Hay Fleming responded 'I frankly admit that my reply to Mr. Preston was severe; but it was not one iota too severe', SAUL MS dep113/2/8/2; MS dep113/2/8/3.
[31] Quoted in Paton, *David Hay Fleming*, pp. 73-74.
[32] *Ibid*., pp. 76, 36.
[33] *Ibid*., pp. 46, 111.
[34] Due to his views on Catholicism some reviewers have discredited scholarly works in which Hay Fleming is cited as a source, R.G. Kyle and D.W. Johnson, *John Knox: an Introduction to his Life and Works* (Eugene, Oregon: Wipf & Stock, 2009), p. 192 n. 46.
[35] Paton, *David Hay Fleming*, pp. 43, 111.
[36] *Ibid*., pp. 47, 48.
[37] SAUL MS 36755; MS dep113/22/26c.
[38] SAUL MS dep113/8/4/9. For the complete correspondence on this matter see SAUL MS dep113/4/1-12.
[39] These endeavours were again recognised in 1905; at a farewell banquet held in his honour before his departure for Edinburgh, it was noted that 'The city [...] owes more than can ever be repaid to the enthusiasm with which the Doctor has concerned himself in its antiquities and best interests', 'Honouring Dr Hay Fleming', p. 5.
[40] SAUL MS 36741/1-2. Hay Fleming was to later gain some teaching experience, lecturing on the subject of Church History at New College, Edinburgh in 1904-05, Paton, *David Hay Fleming*, p. 31.
[41] His first Stone Lectures were concerned with the Reformation, afterwards published as *The Reformation in Scotland: Causes, Characteristics, and Consequences. The Stone Lectures at Princeton Theological Seminary for 1907-1908* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1910). Hay Fleming's second series focused upon Sir Archibald Johnston, Lord Warriston (1611-1663), who assisted Alexander Henderson (c. 1583-1646) in writing the Scottish National Covenant in 1638. At this time Hay Fleming was engaged in editing the second volume of Johnston's diary, published in 1919 for the Scottish History Society.
[42] *The Register of the Privy Seal of Scotland. Vol. III A.D. 1542-1548*, ed. by the late D. Hay Fleming and J. Beveridge (Edinburgh: H.M. General Register House, 1936), p. v.
[43] John Scott was a shipbuilder and engineer who had a love of books, forming one of the finest private libraries in Scotland; with literature relating to his profession, the library also contained works which reflected his interest in Scotland and the Stuarts, as well as rare first editions and early manuscripts, W.F. Spear, 'Scott, John (1830–1903)', rev. A. McConnell, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (Oxford: University Press, 2004) <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/35990> [accessed 09 November 2014].
[44] SAUL MS dep113/60/7. For all of Hay Fleming's tirade against the auctioning of Laing's library, he seems to be forgetting that it was actually the wish of Laing that his library be auctioned after his death, M.C.T. Simpson, 'Laing, David (1793–1878)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/15886> [accessed 09 November 2014]. Sadly for Hay Fleming Scott's collection was auctioned at Sotheby's from 27 March to 3 April 1905.
[45] His father may also have had an interest, some volumes having an acquisition date prior to 1865, when Hay Fleming purchased his first book.
[46] SAUL Hay BT300.A85. Rodden notes that Hay Fleming's library contained two incunabula, but only this one was recorded by the librarians in 1932/33, Rodden, 'The Hay Fleming Reference Library', 111; SAUL MS dep113/39/80, no. 7311.
[47] SAUL Hay BX9420; Hay BX9420.I6; Hay DA775.
[48] SAUL Hay DA385.
[49] SAUL Hay DA452.
[50] SAUL MS dep113/60/7
[51] SAUL MS dep113/40/131.
[52] SAUL MS 36710.
[53] Both SAUL Hay BX9071.

[54] SAUL Hay PC; Hay B785.L4.
[55] Both at SAUL Hay BX8915.R9. The majority of Rutherford's works owned by Hay Fleming are listed in SAUL MS dep113/39/85, no. 6116-6165, most of which are various editions of his *Letters*.
[56] SAUL MS 36710. The two works were *Elements of Plane Geometry* (1833) and *Elements of Solid Geometry* (1834). Thomas Duncan (1777-1858) not only studied at St Andrews, but was also Professor of Mathematics at the University from 1820 until his death.
[57] SAUL Hay BR778.E3C8L7, letter tipped to front free endpaper.
[58] SAUL Hay DA890.S1L1.
[59] A. Cameron, 'The Late Dr Hay Fleming', *Scotsman*, 10 November 1931, p. 13.
[60] D. Hay Fleming, *Critical Reviews Relating Chiefly to Scotland* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1912), p. vii.
[61] SAUL Hay BX4665.G7B8.
[62] D. Hay Fleming, 'St. Andrews', *The Bookman* 5:29 (Feb. 1894), 147.
[63] SAUL Hay DA890.S1L1.
[64] W. Roberts, 'Bookworms of Yesterday and To-Day. The Right Hon. W.E. Gladstone, M.P.', *The Bookworm: An Illustrated Treasury of Old-Time Literature* (Jan., 1890), 162; F. Stimpson, '"I have spent my morning reading Greek": the Marginalia of Sir George Otto Trevelyan', *Library History* 23:3 (2007), 245; G.P. Landow and E. Chew, 'Anthony Trollope's Marginalia in Macaulay's *Critical and Historical Essays*', *Notes and Queries* 48:2 (2001), 153, 154.
[65] SAUL Hay BR789.D6, p. 208.
[66] SAUL Hay BR33.B2;1899, p. 78.
[67] SAUL, Hay BR789.D6, p. 35. The reference appears to refer to a manuscript of John Law, canon of St Andrews, which was at that time preserved in the library of Edinburgh University.
[68] Paton, *David Hay Fleming*, p. 73.
[69] SAUL Hay BR778.E3C8L7.
[70] SAUL Hay BX9081.F6S3, p. 7.
[71] Ibid., p. 9.
[72] SAUL Hay BX9178.W3.
[73] SAUL MS dep113/60/5.
[74] SAUL Hay BR784.G7, vol. 1. For examples of contents in works bound together see SAUL Hay AC911.47(SR) (four tracts bound together) and Hay AC911.79 (14 pamphlets bound together). He would also write more detailed contents in volumes already containing a hand-written one. See SAUL Hay AC911.46 (seven pamphlets bound together).
[75] SAUL Hayf BX9223.R3, front free endpaper.
[76] SAUL Hay BR33.B2;1899, p. 122.
[77] SAUL ms36743/1.
[78] NLS L.C.1276.5, p. 308. This answer appeared in the *Scottish Historical Review* for October 1919 (vol. 17, pp. 46-49).
[79] Stimpson, '"I have spent my morning reading Greek"', 245; J. Snart, 'Recentering Blake's Marginalia', *Huntington Library Quarterly* 66:1/2 (2003), 137; Westphall, '"Laboring in my Books"', esp. 194-199; SAUL MS dep113/5/17/11.
[80] SAUL Hay BX9083.O8S4.
[81] J.A. Secord, *Victorian Sensation. The Extraordinary Publication, Reception, and Secret Authorship of* Vestiges of the Natural History of Creation. (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 2000), p. 236. One exception can be found in Lyon's *History of St Andrews*, where the left margin on p. 140 and the bottom margin on p. 142 of vol. 1 contain lengthy annotations, SAUL Hay DA890.S1L9.
[82] Westphall, '"Laboring in my Books"', 198.
[83] SAUL Hay BR788.N4C3, letter tipped to half-title page.
[84] SAUL Hay BR789.D6, loose sheet between pp. 266-267.
[85] *Ibid*., loose letter between pp. 364-365 and letter tipped in at p. 418.
[86] Hay Fleming records at the front: 'From the extract from the Session Records, at the end of this volume, regarding Martine's seat in the Town Church, it appears that the author of the Reliquiae was a grandson of Doctor George Martine, Provost of St. Salvators College', SAUL MS dep113/60/5.
[87] SAUL Hay BR788.N4C3; SAUL Hay GV964.M8.
[88] H. Guppy, 'Copinger, Walter Arthur (1847–1910)', rev. C. Pease-Watkin, *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/32559> [accessed 09 November 2014].
[89] Cameron, 'The Late Dr Hay Fleming', p. 13.
[90] SAUL MS 36735.
[91] SAUL MS 36761.
[92] SAUL MS dep113/2/11/5.
[93] SAUL MS 36787.

[94] SAUL MS 36724, MS 36754.
[95] Paton, *David Hay Fleming*, p. 102.
[96] *Ibid*.
[97] SAUL MS dep113/40/109. It seems that the entries were not made straight into this notebook. In SAUL MS dep113/1/10 is a list of books lent to Andrew Lang between 26th and 31st December 1900, which then appear in MS dep113/40/109 in a more complete form. Hay Fleming clearly lent material after 1909 (see, for instance, SAUL MS dep113/22/28g, MS dep113/2/6/3a), but no notebook recording this survives.
[98] Crawford's borrowers included magistrates, clergymen, writers, and physicians, as well as a schoolmaster, carpenter, wigmaker, and barber, M.R.M. Towsey, *Reading the Scottish Enlightenment: Books and their Readers in Provincial Scotland, 1750-1820* (Leiden, 2010), p. 51.
[99] SAUL MS dep113/40/109.
[100] SAUL MS dep113/9/1/3/4.
[101] SAUL MS dep113/9/2/41/2.
[102] SAUL MS 36719.
[103] SAUL MS dep113/40/109.
[104] SAUL MS dep113/9/2/41/2. He was true to his word, Hay Fleming marking it as returned on 25 June 1909, SAUL MS dep113/40/109.
[105] SAUL MS dep113/40/109; SAUL MS dep113/38/63, letter pasted in at front. Hay Fleming, too, was guilty of retaining borrowed items for a long time, writing to Craigie that he was anxious to return an engraving 'having kept it too long', SAUL MS 36754.
[106] SAUL MS dep113/40/109.
[107] SAUL MS dep113/22/40.
[108] Quoted in Towsey, *Reading the Scottish Enlightenment*, p. 47. Elizabeth Grant was a significant figure in Scottish literature, writing many articles and short stories (often published anonymously), although she is remembered largely for her posthumously published journal.
[109] SAUL MS dep113/9/2/17.
[110] SAUL MS dep113/40/109.
[111] The copy of E. Taylor's *The Braemar highlands* (Edinburgh: 1873) now in Hay Fleming's library bears the acquisition date 16 March 1922, indicating that a replacement was purchased many years later, SAUL Hay DA880.H7.
[112] SAUL MS 36784.
[113] SAUL MS dep113/2/6/8a-c.
[114] Ibid.
[115] SAUL MS dep113/9/2/14.
[116] SAUL MS dep113/40/109.
[117] Ibid.